Wood ash amended biochar for the removal of lead, copper, zinc and cadmium from aqueous solution

Stuart Cairns, Sampriti Chaudhuri, Gabriel Sigmund, Iain Robertson, Natasha Hawkins, Tom Dunlop, Thilo Hofmann



PII:	S2352-1864(21)00609-X
DOI:	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eti.2021.101961
Reference:	ETI 101961
To appear in:	Environmental Technology & Innovation
Received date :	29 July 2021
Revised date :	7 September 2021

Please cite this article as: S. Cairns, S. Chaudhuri, G. Sigmund et al., Wood ash amended biochar for the removal of lead, copper, zinc and cadmium from aqueous solution. *Environmental Technology & Innovation* (2021), doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eti.2021.101961.

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2021 Published by Elsevier B.V.

Accepted date: 16 September 2021

_	1	Wood ash amended biochar for the removal of lead, copper, zinc and cadmium
1 2 3	2	from aqueous solution
4 5 6 7	3	Author list
8 9	4	Stuart Cairns ^a , Sampriti Chaudhuri ^b , Gabriel Sigmund ^b , Iain Robertson ^a , Natasha Hawkins ^c ,
10 11 12	5	Tom Dunlop ^d , Thilo Hofmann ^b
13 14 15	6	
16 17 18	7	Affiliations
19 20 21	8	^a Department of Geography, Swansea University, Singleton Park, Swansea SA2 8PP, UK
22 23	9	^b Environmental Geosciences, Centre for Microbiology and Environmental Systems Science,
24 25 26	10	University of Vienna, Althanstraße 14, 090 Vienna, Austria
27 28 29	11	° Department of Chemistry, Swansea University, Singleton Park, Swansea SA2 8PP, UK
30 31	12	^d Department of Engineering, Swansea University, Bay Campus, Fabian Way, Crymlyn
32 33 34	13	Burrows, Swansea SA1 8EN, UK
35 36 37	14	
38 39 40	15	Corresponding author
41 42 43	16	Stuart Cairns
44 45 46	17	
47 48		
49 50 51		
52 53 54		
54 55 56		
57 58		
59 60 61		
62 63		1
04 65		

Abstract

Heavy metals in motorway adjoined aqueous environments have increased at an alarming rate over recent years. This increase has been primarily attributed to anthropogenic activities such as the increase of motor vehicle use. Current remediation techniques, such as balancing ponds have the potential to leave toxic residue with the associated removal costs often proving prohibitive. In this study biochar and wood ash amended biochar were evaluated as remediators of inorganic vehicular pollutants found in motorway runoff, specifically Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd. Biochar from European larch (Larix decidua (L.) Karst.) was produced via fast pyrolysis-gasification (485-530 °C for 90 s) and amended with wood ash post pyrolysis. Pristine larch biochar (BC), larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash (WA) and larch biochar sintered with wood ash (WAS) were studied to evaluate metal immobilisation mechanisms and maximum removal capacities. This study demonstrates that the amendment of biochar with wood ash increases Pb, Cu, Zn, and Cd immobilisation by an order of magnitude compared to BC. The addition of wood ash increases pH whilst adding minerals causing precipitation. Precipitation and ion exchange dominate metal immobilization and were not correlated to surface area. Sustainability of feedstock, low feedstock / production costs and maximum measured contaminant removal (61.5 mg/g, 38.9 mg/g, 12.1 mg/g and 10.2 mg/g for Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd respectively) indicate that wood ash amended biochar is a viable option to immobilise Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd from motorway runoff.

Graphical Abstract



40 Keywords

41 Biochar, pH, precipitation, wood ash, heavy metals, runoff

43 1. Introduction

Heavy metals in aqueous environments have increased at an alarming rate over recent years. This increase has been primarily attributed to anthropogenic activities such as mining, waste disposal, industrial activities, agriculture, and the increase of motor vehicles use. As of September 2020 there are ~39 million vehicles registered in the UK, representing an increase of ~5 million vehicles in 10 years (Gov.uk, 2018). This escalating increase in registered vehicles and the resultant increase in annual average daily traffic has been seen to directly correlate with an increase in pollutant input (Hwang et al., 2016). Such an increase in vehicles also naturally necessitates a growth in impermeable urban roads, pavements and motorways. In highly developed areas these surfaces can account for up to 70% of the total surface creating an increase in the volume and velocity of runoff (Budai and Clement, 2011; Ladislas et al., 2015; Hwang et al., 2016). This runoff washes away contaminants from anthropogenic sources, such as motor vehicles, carrying the pollutants into receiving waterbodies (Ladislas et al., 2015). The combination of the growth of motor vehicle numbers and the increase in

impermeable surfaces has led to rising amounts of pollution making traffic a major contributor
of contaminants into the UK's environment (Ladislas *et al.*, 2015).

The sources of vehicle runoff pollution are reasonably well understood and generally occur through abrasive forces or leaks and include tyre wear, brake wear and motor oil. Tyre wear is recognised primarily as a source for zinc (Zn), and to a lesser extent cadmium (Cd), lead (Pb) and copper (Cu) (Legret and Pagotto, 1999; Budai and Clement, 2011). Pollutants released through tyre wear, unlike exhaust emissions, are collected entirely on the road surface, around 90% of which is captured by runoff, and subsequently may leach toxic compounds (Budai and Clement, 2011; Markiewicz et al., 2017). Each tyre releases ~1 kg of mass during its lifespan of 50,000 km (Legret and Pagotto, 1999; Markiewicz et al., 2017); such wear leads to ~1,327,000 tonnes of rubber being released in Europe annually (Wagner et al., 2018). As a consequence Zn has been measured at levels as high as 240 ppm in road dust and as high as 354 µg / L in road runoff (Legret and Pagotto, 1999; Apeagyei et al., 2011). Brake wear is recognised as a primary source of Cu; it has also been shown to contain significant quantities of inorganic contaminants such as Cd, Pb, and Zn (Legret and Pagotto, 1999; Budai and Clement, 2011). Hwang et al (2016) estimate that around 2400 tonnes of Cu was released by brake wear in Europe during 2000. This has, in part, led to concentrations of Cu and Pb being as high as 105 ppm and 73 ppm, respectively in road dust and Cu, Pb, and Cd concentrations in runoff being as high as 45 µg / L, 58 µg / L, and 2.7 µg / L, respectively (Legret and Pagotto, 1999; Farm, 2002). Motor oil is also recognised as a contributor to inorganic pollution including Zn and to a lesser degree Pb and Cu (Budai and Clement, 2011). Organic pollutants from sources such as tyre wear and motor oil are also of concern (Markiewicz et al., 2017). In addition to these sources exhaust emissions are a significant source of organic particulate matter (PM) such as polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) and inorganic PM including metals (Agarwal, 2007).

The primary inorganic pollutants found in motorway runoff can also be found in other polluted
waters such as mine water, tailing ponds and industrial effluent in rivers. In these environments

concentrations of pollutants are often reported to be even higher than in road dust / runoff.
Abandoned metal mines are polluting waters with Pb, Cu and Zn at concentrations regularly
over 1000 µg / L (Todd et al., 2021); metal pollution in mine tailing ponds have been recorded
at levels of 150 ppm (Pb), 230 ppm (Cu) and 146 ppm (Zn) (Pagnanelli *et al.*, 2004); and
extensive industrial Pb, Cu, Zn, and Cd river pollution has been measured with Zn as high as
167.8 µg / L (Saha *et al.*, 2017).

Heavy metal pollutants entering waterways as a result of motor vehicles can lead to freshwater degradation, threaten local plants and organisms, and negatively affect human health. Where metal levels accumulate and increase beyond acceptable levels they become toxic and as a result a significant environmental hazard for invertebrates and fish (Yi et al., 2011). Humans are exposed to these heavy metals via the food chain and freshwater leisure activities. This can lead to significant adverse health consequences such as reduced neurological function, reduced liver function, reduced fertility, kidney damage, lung damage, osteoporosis and mortality (Morais et al., 2012).

Although the impact of motorway runoff is recognised, current Sustainable Drainage Systems (SuDS) that attempt to lessen the consequences of vehicle pollution have the unintended consequence of filling with toxic residues with high removal costs. Presently attempts to mitigate heavy metals primarily involve sedimentation, the subsequent accumulation of which then require expensive treatment and extraction. SuDS such as balancing ponds (wet and dry), sedimentation tanks, grassed surface water channels and constructed wetlands capture sediment mitigating the flow of pollutants into water ways (Farm, 2002; Meland, 2016). Although these methods initially reduce the influx of pollutants into freshwater systems, as sediment levels increase with age, remediation effectiveness reduces (Farm, 2002). The removal of this toxic sediment involves dredging which is prohibitively expensive (Meland, 2016).

The use of biochar is a potential remediation technique for motorway runoff, as well as for mine waters and industrially polluted rivers, that could overcome the shortcomings and expense of current runoff sedimentation techniques. This study sets out to explore biochar and wood ash amended biochar in terms of the immobilisation of four key inorganic contaminants found in motorway runoff: Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd. Engineered biochar is defined as the carbon rich product obtained from the thermal decomposition of organic material under oxygen limited conditions (pyrolysis) at temperatures generally under 900°C (Lehmann and Joseph, 2009). The use of biochar in the immobilisation of metals in aqueous media has been highlighted by a number of researchers with a view to remediate polluted waters (Bandara et al., 2020; Cairns et al., 2020). Its attractiveness is enhanced due to its relatively low cost, availability and sustainability (Ahmad et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2018). Pristine biochar immobilises inorganic contaminants via six key mechanisms: Cation exchange, change in speciation with subsequent precipitation, cation- π interactions, functional group complexation, electrostatic attraction, and reduction (Mohan et al., 2011; Ahmad et al., 2014; Bandara et al., 2020).

Wood ash, a by-product of biomass power plants, can be used as an amendment to biochar with the potential to improve biochar's immobilisation of inorganic contaminants due to its mineral fraction and pH buffering capacity. The major components of wood ash have been reported as Ca, K, Mg, S, P and Si (Cerrato et al., 2016). Ca, K and Mg play an important role in ion exchange. The presence of P and Si can induce the formation of phosphates, silicates and siloxane which can be important in forming precipitates. The chemical constituents of wood ash including alkali and alkaline earth metals, oxides and carbonates also have the potential to cause the amended biochar to increase and buffer its environments pH inducing changes in metal speciation that are favourable for the immobilisation of cationic metals such as Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd (Cerrato et al., 2016; Fidel et al., 2017). Cairns et al. (2020) demonstrate that the addition of wood ash as an amendment to pristine biochar can increase immobilisation

of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd. The process was driven by pH and P content, but detailed understanding
of driving immobilisation mechanisms remained elusive.

The primary aim of this study is to ascertain if pristine larch biochar and / or wood ash amended biochar is effective as an alternative green remediator of inorganic vehicular pollutants found in motorway runoff specifically Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd. Such remediation would also be relevant for mine waters and industrially polluted rivers. The effect of biochar amendments on immobilisation capacities and mechanisms were investigated to understand if scaling up is plausible.

2. Methods:

145 2.1 Biochar production and wood ash amendment

European larch (Larix decidua (L.) Karst.) wood chips were pyrolyzed in a Pyrocal BigChar-1000 pyrolysis-gasification kiln at a temperature of 485-530°C, with a retention time of ~90s. The biochar was granulated to <3mm with a Tria G1 granulator. Wood ash, originating from a renewable energy plant in the UK, was added to the biochar post pyrolysis via two methods. For the first method the wood ash was mixed at a ratio of 1:1 with biochar that had been allowed to cool to ambient temperature in a cement mixer for 15 minutes. For the second method, it was mixed with the freshly pyrolyzed, still hot biochar at a ratio of 1:1 for 15 minutes in a cement mixer to sinter the materials. Wood ash was chosen as an amendment due to its mineral fraction (including Ca, K, Mg, S, P and Si) and pH buffering capacity. The pristine larch biochar, larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash and larch biochar sintered with wood ash are referred to as BC, WA, and WAS throughout the study.

157 2.2 Biochar Characterisation

158 Sorbents were characterised via surface area and pore size analyser, Fourier transform 159 infrared spectroscopy (FTIR), x-ray powder diffraction (XRD) and scanning electron 160 microscopy with energy dispersive x-ray (SEM-EDX) analysis. FTIR was undertaken using a

Perkin Elmer Spectrum Two FTIR Spectrometer. Measurements are in the range of 400-4000 cm⁻¹ to compare possible changes before and after sorbent loading. Pristine larch biochar (BC), larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash (WA) and larch biochar sintered with wood ash (WAS) were each mixed with KBr at a ratio of 1:100 (W/W) (Merino et al., 2017). XRD was used to identify possible crystalline precipitates formed on the surface of the sorbents. XRD patterns were obtained using a Bruker D8 Discover with a Copper source (40kV, 40mA) and a 1D detector. Powdered sorbents were pushed flat on a single signal silicate zero diffraction plate to minimise background interference. Scans themselves had a 0.5 second time per step and an increment of 0.02° over the range of 10-90 (Hasan Khan Tushar et al., 2012; Li et al., 2017). Specific surface area and pore volume distribution were determined from N₂ physisorption isotherms using the Brunauer-Emmett-Teller method and Barrett-Joyner-Halenda method respectively. Vacuum dried samples were degassed at 105°C overnight and initially measured with N₂ adsorption at the liquid nitrogen temperature of -196°C (77K) by a NOVA 2000e surface area and pore size analyser (Cao and Harris, 2010). Due to the small pore size of the pristine biochar, CO₂ was also used to determine pore size distribution because of microporosity and kinetic limitations with N_2 physisorption (Sigmund *et al.*, 2017). Surface morphologies were examined by scanning electron microscopy (Hitachi TM3000 desktop microscope). A working distance of 10mm and an acceleration voltage of 15kV were used and images were obtained using the in-built Hitachi TM3000 software. Elemental composition analysis was undertaken at the same surface locations by electron dispersive x-ray spectroscopy (EDX) attached to the Hitachi TM3000 desktop microscope. An EDX spectrum was produced after scanning the area of interest for ten minutes. Samples were mounted to aluminium SEM stubs using conductive double-sided carbon tape to enable examination of samples in an uncoated state (Eiblmeier et al., 2014).

185 2.3 Sorption Experiments

 186 Sorption batch experiments were carried out using Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd at five different 187 concentrations in the range of 10 mg/L to 150 mg/L applying different sorbent to solution ratio

to increase the range of measured sorbent loading. This range included scenarios to stress

the sorbents beyond what could be reasonably expected in road runoff and oversaturate them (Crabtree et al., 2009; Zhao et al., 2010). All chemical reagents were of analytical grade and the five concentrations were obtained by preparing a stock solution (1000 mg/L) of the metals, lead (II) nitrate (N₂O₆Pb) copper (II) nitrate hydrate (CuH₂N₂O₇), Zinc nitrate usina hexahydrate ($H_{12}N_2O_{12}Zn$) and cadmium nitrate tetrahydrate (CdH₈N₂O₁₀) and diluting with deionized water. The pH was adjusted to ~4.7 with the dropwise addition of HNO₃ to achieve an equal pH between solutions that represented the closest to runoff conditions before precipitation occurred for those metals. Two types of control experiments were included -biochar without contaminants, as well as contaminants without biochar. All experiments were performed in triplicates using a batch sorption equilibrium method (OECD, 2000)

All sorbents were oven dried at 105 °C for 24 h. A known amount of biochar (particle size of < 3mm) was added to 25 mL of aqueous solution in 40 mL polyethylene Falcon tubes. Agitation was achieved on a Unitwist 400 Orbital Shaker for 48 hrs at ~280 rpm to reach equilibrium. Studies such as Uchimiya et al., (2011) prescribe contact of 24 hours to reach equilibrium, but longer contact times haven't shown significant changes in equilibrium concentration and ensure that the adsorption phase had reached equilibrium (Wang et al., 2018). The solution was subsequently separated from the sorbent using an MSE Centaur 2 centrifuge at 3000 rpm for 15 minutes (OECD, 2000). The supernatant was removed, pH measured using a calibrated Voltcraft pH Meter and immediately acidified to < pH 2 with 1mL of 70% HNO₃ before being filtered with a 0.45 µm PTFE syringe filter for analysis.

Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd concentrations of the acidified supernatants were measured using
Inductively Coupled Plasma - Optical Emission Spectroscopy (ICP-OES 5110, Agilent
Technologies Inc., USA). Sorbent loading (q) was calculated from the difference between
initial metal concentration and final metal concentrations in the aqueous phase:

 $q = (c_i - c_{aq}) V / W$

where ci is the initial concentration of metals in solution, cag is the final equilibrium concentration of metals in solution, V is the volume of solution and W is the weight of the biochar.Equilibrium sorption coefficients (Kd) were calculated as:

 $Kd = q/c_{aq}$

where, Kd (L/kg) = amount of metal adsorbed onto biochar per L of water, g (mg/kg) = sorbent

loading (metals adsorbed by biochar) and C_{aq} (mg/L) = concentration in the aqueous phase.

Kd is commonly used in estimating the potential sorption of dissolved metals by a solid phase with higher values indicating higher sorption potential (Pourret and Houben, 2018),

The contaminant loaded sorbents were further analysed via FTIR, XRD, SEM-EDX to detect changes before and after sorption.

2.4 Water chemistry and metal speciation

For speciation determination, samples with and without contaminants at a selected concentration of 10 mg/L were analysed for other water chemistry parameters. These included (i) base cation analysis (Ca, K, Na, and Mg) using ICP-OES, (ii) major anions (Cl⁻, $NO_3^{2^-}$, $PO_4^{3^-}$ and SO_4^{2-}) using an ion exchange chromatograph (IC 930 Compact Flex, Metrohm, Switzerland) and (iii) dissolved organic carbon using TOC analyser (Shimadzu, TOC-L series), measuring non-purgeable organic carbon (NPOC). Speciation analysis of the solutions were 40 230 carried out using Visual MINTEQ version 3.1. Base cation analysis was also used to review possible cation exchange. Total P and Si in the above solutions were measured via ICP-OES. Together with PO₄³⁻ analysis, these parameters were used to check for their involvements in the immobilization process. Speciation of C in the solid phase was measured using a multiphase carbon analyzer RC-612 from LECO.

3. Results and discussion

3.1 Contaminant removal by biochar and wood ash amended biochars

Analysis of the aqueous phase shows that wood ash amended biochar, both cold mixed with wood ash (WA) and sintered with wood ash (WAS), removed significantly more metals than pristine larch biochar (BC) (SI 3A, B, C, D). Metals were removed in the order of Pb>Cu>Zn>Cd by all three sorbents. The removal of Pb by BC was the lowest amongst the sorbents with a maximum measured removal of 7.8 ± 0.1 mg/g (SI 5A). The maximum measured removal of Pb by WA was $61.5 \pm 3.1 \text{ mg/g}$ and by WAS was $54.6 \pm 3.3 \text{ mg/g}$ (SI 5A). Maximum measured removal of Cu by BC was again the lowest amongst the materials at $3.5 \pm 0.1 \text{ mg/g}$ (SI5 B). WA and WAS showed similar patterns and quantities of Cu removal to each other, however WA showed a greater maximum measured removal at 38.9 ± 2.4 mg/g with WAS at 33.8 ± 2.3 mg/g (SI5 B). The maximum measured removal of Zn by BC at 0.8 ± 0.1 mg/g was significantly lower than both WA and WAS (SI5 C). WA and WAS were very similar to each other in terms of Zn removal but, again, the maximum measured removal by WA was higher at 12.1 \pm 0.2 mg/g than WAS at 11.2 \pm 0.1 mg/g (SI5 C). Cd was the metal that had the lowest measured removal by each of the materials. At 0.7 \pm 0.1 mg/g the maximum measured removal of Cd by BC was again significantly lower than both WA and WAS (SI5 D). The removal of Cd and Zn show very similar removal behaviour in contrast with Cu and Pb which both had a significantly higher maximum measured removal (SI5). WA and WAS show very similar Cd removal; however, WA with a maximum measured removal of 10.2 \pm 0.2 mg/g did outperform WAS with a maximum measured removal of 9.3 \pm 0.1 mg/g (SI5 D). Removal was measured within a multi metal solution where the presence of competing metal ions in the solution for the same sorption sites can reduce the removal rate (Mantonanaki et al., 2016) which impacts Zn and Cd removal rates more than Pb and Cu (Xu and Zhao, 2013).



Figure 1: Bar graph showing the equilibrium distribution coefficients (Kd) of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd with pristine larch biochar (BC), larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash (WA) and larch biochar sintered with wood ash (WAS) at 10 mg/L, and stacked bars in the background showing metal aqueous species distributions. Error bars show \pm SD (n = 3).

3.2 Aqueous phase chemistry – immobilization via precipitation and ion exchange

Speciation plots across pH show that the distribution shifts from their divalent forms to hydroxyl forms as the pH increases (SI 1). As shown in Figure 1, the existence of these metal species in different hydroxyl forms is accompanied by increased sorption affinities (K_d values). Addition of anions such as PO_4^{3-} , Cl⁻ and SO_4^{2-} into solution can lead to the formation of mineral

precipitates. This combination of increased pH and presence of dissolved anions from wood ash drives immobilization of the metals, due to oversaturation with certain mineral forms, especially for Cd and Zn. Modeled saturation indices (SI 2A and 2B) indicate the possibility of formation of precipitates such as $Cd_4(OH)_6SO_4$, $Zn(OH)_2$ and ZnO, being more prominent for wood ash amended chars. Also, multiple phosphate containing phases, such as $Pb_5(PO_4)_3CI$, Cd₃(PO₄)₂, Pb₃(PO₄)₂ are seen to be oversaturated. From MINTEQ modeling (SI 3) it was determined that 99.5% and 99.9% of Pb and Cu, respectively, can be precipitated. Wood ash amendments further allowed 99.4% Cd and 98.5% Zn to precipitate. Additionally, 99% and 73% of PO₄³⁻ can form precipitates in BC and WA/WAS systems, respectively.

In addition to modelling, differences in the total P, PO_4^{3-} and Si levels in the solutions with and without the metals for the different materials (Figure 2) provide further evidence of precipitation. For all three materials, total P in solution was significantly reduced and PO43-levels fall below the limit of quantification for all solutions with metals in contrast to solutions without metals. This implies that some of the metal ions in solution are complexing with PO₄³⁻ and precipitating onto the biochar surface, or co-precipitating with PO₄³⁻. For WA and WAS, Si levels were also reduced from 2.53 mg/L to 2.06 mg/L and from 2.44 mg/L to 2.01 mg/L in the presence of the metals. From these results, it is implied that Si in the form of silicates on the sorbent surfaces might be playing a role in the immobilization process for wood ash amended biochars as seen in previous studies by Lu et al. (2012) and Gao et al. (2019). Carbonate containing metal phases were not accounted and modelled for. However, C speciation analysis of the solid phase using the carbon analyzer showed that WA and WAS had 0.97% and 0.79% of inorganic C present, respectively. Thus, it is expected that the metals can also be immobilized through formation of carbonates.



Figure 2: Concentration of Total P, phosphate (PO4³⁻) and Si in solution in the presence of different sorbents without and with metals (n=3)

All three sorbents also affect the water chemistry by adding base cations such as Ca²⁺, Mg²⁺, K⁺ and Na⁺. Increased cation release in the presence of metals can indicate cation exchange processes occurring on the surface of biochar (Uchimiya et al., 2010). If cation exchange is one of the driving mechanisms for immobilization, the target divalent metal contaminants will tend to replace divalent cations on the surface of the biochar, such as Ca2+ and Mg2+ rather than monovalent ones. For this purpose, we investigated base cations released from the sorbents, with and without 10 mg/L of metals present (Figure 3). For BC, small increases in concentration of the base cations Mg^{2+} , Na^+ and K^+ were observed from 0.72 ± 0.2 mg/L to 1.33 ± 0.1 mg/L, from 1.05 ± 0.0 mg/L to 1.41 ± 0.1 mg/L and from 11.19 ± 1.1 mg/L to 17.20± 0.8 mg/L, respectively. This indicates that cation exchange may be important in metal immobilisation by BC. For the wood ash amended biochars, a marked two-fold increase in Ca²⁺ concentration in the presence of metals was observed (Figure 2). For WA and WAS, Ca²⁺ increased from 8.7 \pm 0.7 mg/L to 22.3 \pm 4.1 mg/L and from 10.4 \pm 1.0 mg/L to 20.7 \pm 2.1 mg/L respectively. Increased levels of divalent Mg²⁺ were also observed for the wood ash amended chars. For WA Mg²⁺ increased from 0.63 ± 0.0 mg/L without metals to 1.23 ± 0.3 mg/L with

contaminants. For WAS, this was not as apparent with a concentration increase from $1.11 \pm 0.1 \text{ mg/L}$ to $1.32 \pm 0.2 \text{ mg/L}$. This increased release of base cations in the presence of the metals with the wood ash treatments indicates that cation exchange plays a role in the immobilization process. Such ion exchange is seen to be a key immobilisation mechanism for Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd by several studies but is secondary to precipitation (Lu *et al.*, 2012; Gao *et al.*, 2019).



Figure 3: Concentration of base cations in solution in the presence of the different sorbents without and with metals (n=3)

The pH of solution showed increases for each of the sorbents, with wood ash amended biochars increasing pH significantly more than BC (SI 4A). Rises in pH were greater at lower concentrations of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd. There is strong correlation between rises in solution pH and immobilisation (SI 4B). For all of the sorbents such correlation is likely, at least in part, as a result of ion exchange increasing with pH driving the increase in negative charge of functional groups allowing alkali and alkaline earth metals to be exchanged more easily (Silber et al., 2010). For wood ash amended biochars, but not for BC, the correlation of immobilisation and pH is also a result of the increase in pH driving precipitation. The pH buffering ability of the wood ash amended biochars raises the solution pH making it alkaline enough for (i) metal

hydroxide precipitation (SI 2A and 2B) (Chen *et al.*, 2015), and (ii) precipitation with
phosphates and silicates (Uchimiya *et al.*, 2010).

3.3 Solid Phase Analysis - immobilisation via precipitation and ion exchange

The following pre and post immobilisation solid phase analysis (FTIR, SEM-EDX, and XRD) were implemented to further investigate the mechanisms of each sorbent in the immobilisation of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd alongside the measurement of surface area.

FTIR was used to identify functional groups to denote ion exchange, minerals capable of precipitation and aromatic structures for BC, WA and WAS. WA and WAS follow very similar pattern of peaks within the FTIR spectra pre-adsorption of the metal solution (Figure 4). Whilst BC also shows similarities to WA and WAS in peaks above 1500 cm¹ pre-adsorption, key differences between wood ash amended biochar and BC are evident below 1500 cm¹. Below 1500 cm¹ peaks for both WA and WAS are seen which are attributed to phosphate (Uchimiya et al., 2010), siloxane (Gao et al., 2019) as well as oxygenated functional groups (lqbal et al., 2009); phosphate and siloxane peaks, important for precipitation, are not evident in the FTIR spectra of BC.



Figure 4 - FTIR spectra of pristine larch biochar (BC), larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash
(WA) and larch biochar sintered with wood ash (WAS) before immobilisation of Pb, Cu, Zn
and Cd.

The FTIR results for BC pre and post adsorption of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn show increases in the intensity of wavelengths attributed to carbonyl and carboxyl surface functional groups again indicating that ion exchange is taking place (Li et al., 2014). However, BC's spectra show no indication of precipitation (figure 5A). The FTIR results for WA and WAS pre and post adsorption of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn show shifts and a flattening of peaks attributed to carboxyl surface functional groups also indicating ion exchange (figures 5B and 5C). These shifts may be attributed to changes in the counterions associated with carboxylate anions (Iqbal et al., 2009).

363 Studies have shown such shifts to demonstrate ion exchange for Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd (Iqbal *et al.*, 2009; Bandara *et al.*, 2020). Studies have also shown the ion exchange of carboxyl to be 365 stronger for Pb and Cu than that of Cd resulting in lower levels of Cd adsorption agreeing with 366 the sorption ordering of this study further pointing to the role of ion exchange for all of the

 sorbents studied (Xu and Zhao, 2013). WA FTIR spectra show a shift and increase in intensity
for peaks assigned to both phosphate and Si-O-Si, WAS spectra also show a peak shift for
both phosphate and Si-O-Si. Xu *et al.* (2013) attributed similar shifts in peaks to the formation
of metal precipitates.

 FTIR analysis indicates that ion exchange is an immobilisation mechanism for all three sorbents but only demonstrates precipitation with phosphate and Si-O-Si for wood ash amended biochars. This difference is likely to partially account for the difference in removal between BC and wood ash amended biochars.





Figure 5: (A) FTIR spectra of larch biochar (BC) pre and post immobilisation of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd (B) FTIR spectra of larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash (WA) pre and post immobilisation of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd (C) FTIR spectra of larch biochar sintered with wood ash (WAS) pre and post immobilisation of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd

SEM-EDX analysis was used to observe the morphology and structure of the sorbents and to ascertain the elemental composition and distribution including the presence of immobilised Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd. For BC SEM-EDX did not show signs of precipitation such as high levels of P or Si or bright areas on the surface of the char. In contrast, SEM images of WAS post adsorption did show bright areas on the surface of the char (SI 7A) which are Pb rich phases (Lu et al., 2012). The EDX spectrum associated with this SEM image demonstrates the presence of P, O, CI and C alongside Pb, Cu and Zn (SI 8A). SEM images of WA post adsorption also showed the bright areas associated with Pb alongside high levels of P, O, Si, C, Cl, Cu and Zn seen in the corresponding EDX spectra (SI 7B and SI 8B). Again, Cd was not present in this zone. In addition to the elemental results of EDX, XRD analysis indicated the presence of carbonates, siloxane and phosphates in both WA and WAS (SI 9). Where metals are seen in the presence of high levels of minerals such as P or Si precipitation between these metals and minerals should be expected (Trakal et al., 2014) and as such

precipitation should again be considered a mechanism in the immobilisation of metals by wood ash amended biochars, a mechanism not evidenced for BC. SEM images of BC post adsorption did not show large bright areas or crystalline structures which would indicate precipitation (SI7 C). EDX elemental data showed that Cu, Zn and Cd were not detected at all and that Pb is present in this zone but in small quantities when compared to wood ash amended biochars (0.51%) (SI 8 A, B, C). P, CI and Si were all undetected, but K was evidenced in this zone again indicating the potential for ion exchange (SI8 C). There is also no evidence of carbonates, siloxane or phosphates for BC within the XRD analysis making precipitation unlikely as an important mechanism.

The dominant mechanism for Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd removal by wood amended biochars is precipitation with ion exchange also playing a role. However, these mechanisms do not correlate to surface area. Although BC had the lowest measured removal of each contaminant its surface area (409 m²/g) is significantly higher than the surface area of WA (34.5 m²/g) or WAS (26.5 m²/g). Pore size distribution for WA and WAS follow similar patterns to each other both with a high concentration of pores with 41 Å diameter (SI 10A and B). BC however shows a high concentration of smaller pores with 31 Å diameter (SI 10C). SEM-EDX images show BC to have an unblocked honeycomb structure with 98% C (figure 6A). Although WA has a similar structure the pores are blocked with only 29% C due to the presence of other elements such as P, Si, K and Na (Figure 6B). Despite the addition of the wood ash being seen to reduce surface area by more than an order of magnitude this does not impact negatively on immobilisation. The wood ash amendment and resultant pH, mineral and functional group increases have proven to be more important than surface area. WA and WAS pores are blocked by the minerals added with the wood ash, such pore blocking has been seen by Hu et al., (2015) in their study of iron impregnated biochar whereby the iron clogged pore openings on the biochar surface whilst increasing metal removal from solution. Although surface area is often seen as an important physical property for contaminant sorption, comparative studies have shown that when surface area of a char is lower but immobilisation

423 is higher, as seen in this study, chemical processes such as ion exchange or more importantly

424 precipitation supersede the importance of surface area (Wang et al., 2018).





Figure 6 – (A) SEM image of the honeycomb structure of the pristine larch biochar (BC) (B)
SEM image of the honeycomb structure of the larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash (WA)
which is blocked with P, Si, K and Na.

430 4. <u>Conclusion</u>

This study investigated if pristine larch biochar (BC) or wood ash amended biochar was effective as an alternative and green remediator of the inorganic vehicular pollutants Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd found in motorway runoff, mine waters and industrially polluted rivers. It also set out to investigate why BC, larch biochar cold mixed with wood ash (WA) and larch biochar sintered with wood ash (WAS) immobilised these contaminants and understand differences between wood ash amended biochar and BC in terms of contaminant removal and immobilisation mechanisms. Maximum measured removal of Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd by WA and WAS were significantly higher than BC alone. This difference was the result of the wood ash amendment increasing pH, thus shifting metal species, and increasing the presence of minerals such as PO₄³⁻ causing immobilization of the metals through precipitation. The proportion of hydroxides modelled for BC is far less than for wood ash amended biochars likely resulting in precipitation accounting for less immobilisation of the contaminants. Although precipitation with phosphate and silicates, was found to be an immobilisation mechanism for WA and WAS, precipitation with silicates was not observed for BC further highlighting differences in removal between wood ash amended biochars and BC. Ion exchange contributed to the immobilisation of the contaminants for all three sorbents. Surface area was not seen to be a dominant factor for metal removal with precipitation and ion exchange superseding its importance.

Sustainability of feedstock, maximum measured removal (61.5 mg/g, 38.9 mg/g, 12.1 mg/g
and 10.2 mg/g for Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd respectively) and low feedstock / production costs
indicate that wood ash amended biochar is a viable option to immobilise Pb, Cu, Zn and Cd
from motorway runoff.

² 453

 454 Acknowledgements

Ysgoloriaeth Sgiliau Economi Gwybodaeth (KESS) yn Gymru gyfan sgiliau lefel uwch yn fenter a arweinir gan Brifysgol Bangor ar ran y sector AU yng Nghymru. Fe'i cyllidir yn rhannol gan Gronfeydd Cymdeithasol Ewropeaidd (ESF) cydgyfeirio ar gyfer Gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd.

Knowledge Economy Skills Scholarships (KESS) is a pan-Wales higher level skills initiative led by Bangor University on behalf of the HE sector in Wales. It is part funded by the Welsh Government's European Social Fund (ESF) convergence programme for West Wales and the Valleys.

This work is part funded by the Welsh Government's European Social Fund (ESF) convergence programme for West Wales and the Valleys.

The authors would also like to extend the acknowledgements to Professor Alayne Street-Perrott (Swansea University), Richard Haine (Frog Environmental), Sion Brackenbury (TerrAffix Soil Solutions), Peter Lanfear (TerrAffix Soil Solutions) and Dr Ian Mabbett (Swansea University)

Agarwal, A. K. (2007) 'Biofuels (alcohols and biodiesel) applications as fuels for internal combustion engines', Progress in Energy and Combustion Science, 33(3), pp. 233–271. doi:

10.1016/j.pecs.2006.08.003.

Ahmad, M. et al. (2014) 'Biochar as a sorbent for contaminant management in soil and

water : A review', Chemosphere. Elsevier Ltd, 99, pp. 19-33. doi:

10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.10.071.

Apeagyei, E. et al. (2011) 'Distribution of heavy metals in road dust along an urban-rural

gradient in Massachusetts', Atmospheric Environment. Elsevier Ltd, 45(13), pp. 2310-2323.

doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2010.11.015.

Bandara, T. et al. (2020) 'Mechanisms for the removal of Cd(II) and Cu(II) from aqueous

solution and mine water by biochars derived from agricultural wastes', Chemosphere.

Elsevier Ltd, 254, p. 126745. doi: 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.126745.

Budai, P. and Clement, A. (2011) 'Refinement of national-scale heavy metal load estimations in road runoff based on field measurements', Transportation Research Part D: Transport and *Environment*. Elsevier Ltd, 16(3), pp. 244–250. doi: 10.1016/j.trd.2010.12.003. **486**

487 Cairns, S. et al. (2020) 'The removal of lead, copper, zinc and cadmium from aqueous solution by biochar and amended biochars', Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 27(17). doi: 10.1007/s11356-020-08706-3.

Cao, X. and Harris, W. (2010) 'Properties of dairy-manure-derived biochar pertinent to its potential use in remediation', Bioresource Technology. Elsevier Ltd, 101(14), pp. 5222-5228. doi: 10.1016/j.biortech.2010.02.052.

Cerrato, J. M. et al. (2016) Wildfires and water chemistry: Effect of metals associated with **494** wood ash', Environmental Science: Processes and Impacts. Royal Society of Chemistry, ⁵⁶ 495 18(8), pp. 1078–1089. doi: 10.1039/c6em00123h.

Chen, T. et al. (2015) 'Adsorption of cadmium by biochar derived from municipal sewage

sludge: Impact factors and adsorption mechanism', Chemosphere. Elsevier Ltd, 134, pp. 286-293. doi: 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.04.052. Crabtree, B. et al. (2009) 'The development of an ecological approach to manage the pollution risk from highway runoff', Water Science and Technology, 59(3), pp. 549-555. doi: 10.2166/wst.2009.876. Eiblmeier, J. et al. (2014) 'New insights into the early stages of silica-controlled barium carbonate crystallisation', Nanoscale. Royal Society of Chemistry, 6(24), pp. 14939–14949. doi: 10.1039/c4nr05436a. Farm, C. (2002) 'Evaluation of the accumulation of sediment and heavy metals in a storm-water detention pond', Water Science and Technology, 45(7), pp. 105–112. Fidel, R. B. et al. (2017) 'Characterization and quantification of biochar alkalinity', Chemosphere, 167, pp. 367–373. doi: 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.09.151. Gao, L. Y. et al. (2019) 'Relative distribution of Cd2+ adsorption mechanisms on biochars derived from rice straw and sewage sludge', Bioresource Technology. Elsevier, 272(September 2018), pp. 114–122. doi: 10.1016/j.biortech.2018.09.138. Gov.uk (2018) Data on all licensed and registered vehicles, produced by Department for Transport. Available at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_da ta/file/699011/veh0102.ods (Accessed: 11 March 2019). Han, L. et al. (2017) 'Lead adsorption by biochar under the elevated competition of cadmium and aluminum', Scientific Reports. Springer US, 7(1), pp. 1-11. doi: 10.1038/s41598-017-02353-4. Hasan Khan Tushar, M. S. et al. (2012) 'Production, characterization and reactivity studies of chars produced by the isothermal pyrolysis of flax straw', Biomass and Bioenergy. Elsevier Ltd, 37, pp. 97–105. doi: 10.1016/j.biombioe.2011.12.027.

Hu, X. et al. (2015) 'Batch and column sorption of arsenic onto iron-impregnated biochar

synthesized through hydrolysis', Water Research. Elsevier Ltd, 68, pp. 206–216. doi:

10.1016/j.watres.2014.10.009.

Hwang, H.-M. et al. (2016) 'Review of pollutants in urban road dust and stormwater runoff:

part 1. Heavy metals released from vehicles', International Journal of Urban Sciences, 20(3),

pp. 334-360. doi: 10.1080/12265934.2016.1193041.

Igbal, M. et al. (2009) 'Characterization of adsorptive capacity and investigation of

mechanism of Cu2+, Ni2+ and Zn2+ adsorption on mango peel waste from constituted metal **529**

¹⁹ 530 solution and genuine electroplating effluent', Separation Science and Technology, 44(15),

pp. 3770-3791. doi: 10.1080/01496390903182305.

Ladislas, S. et al. (2015) 'Floating treatment wetlands for heavy metal removal in highway

stormwater ponds', Ecological Engineering. Elsevier B.V., 80, pp. 85-91. doi:

29 534 10.1016/j.ecoleng.2014.09.115.

₃₂ 535 Legret, M. and Pagotto, C. (1999) 'Evaluation of pollutant loadings in the runoff waters from a major rural highway', Science of the Total Environment, 235(1–3), pp. 143–150. doi: 10.1016/S0048-9697(99)00207-7.

³⁹ 538 Lehmann, J. and Joseph, S. (2009) Biochar for environmental management science and technology. 1st edn. London: Earthscan.

Li, H. et al. (2014) 'Infrared spectroscopic study on the modified mechanism of aluminum-impregnated bone charcoal', Journal of Spectroscopy, 2014. doi: 10.1155/2014/671956.

Li, H. et al. (2017) 'Effect of pyrolysis temperature on characteristics and aromatic

contaminants adsorption behavior of magnetic biochar derived from pyrolysis oil distillation

544 residue', Bioresource Technology. Elsevier Ltd, 223, pp. 20-26. doi:

⁵⁶ 545 10.1016/j.biortech.2016.10.033.

Lu, H. et al. (2012) 'Relative distribution of Pb 2+ sorption mechanisms by sludge-derived

547 biochar', Water Research. Elsevier Ltd, 46(3), pp. 854–862. doi:

548 10.1016/j.watres.2011.11.058.

549 Mantonanaki, A. et al. (2016) 'Cu (II) AND Pb (II) REMOVAL FROM AQUEOUS

550 SOLUTION USING BIOCHAR', (September 2016).

551 Markiewicz, A. et al. (2017) 'Emissions of organic pollutants from traffic and roads: Priority

552 pollutants selection and substance flow analysis', Science of the Total Environment. The

553 Authors, 580, pp. 1162–1174. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.12.074.

554 Meland, S. (2016) Management of contaminated runoff water : current practice and future

555 research needs. Available at: http://www.cedr.eu/download/Publications/2016/CEDR2016-1-

²² 556 Management-of-contaminated-runoff-water.pdf.

²⁵ 557 Merino, A. *et al.* (2017) 'Characterization of the Organic Matter in Wood Ash from Biomass

558 Power Plants in Relation to the Potential Use as Amendments in Agriculture : Organic

559 CHARACTERIZATION OF THE ORGANIC MATTER IN WOOD ASH FROM BIOMASS

560 POWER PLANTS IN RELATION TO THE POTENTIAL', (April). doi: 10.1002/ldr.2743.

Mohan, D. *et al.* (2011) 'Modeling and evaluation of chromium remediation from water using
low cost bio-char, a green adsorbent', *Journal of Hazardous Materials*. Elsevier B.V., 188(1–
3), pp. 319–333. doi: 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2011.01.127.

Morais, S. *et al.* (2012) 'Heavy metals and human health', *Environmental Health - Emerging Issues and Practice*, (February), pp. 227–246. doi: 10.1201/b13683.

566 OECD (2000) 'Test No. 106: Adsorption -- Desorption Using a Batch Equilibrium Method',
567 OECD Guidelines for the Testing of Chemicals, p. Section 1. doi: 10.1097/00001888-

568 199702000-00023.

Pagnanelli, F. *et al.* (2004) 'Sequential extraction of heavy metals in river sediments of an
 abandoned pyrite mining area: pollution detection and affinity series', *Environmental Pollution*. Elsevier, 132(2), pp. 189–201. doi: 10.1016/J.ENVPOL.2004.05.002.

Pourret, O. and Houben, D. (2018) 'Characterization of metal binding sites onto biochar
using rare earth elements as a fingerprint', *Heliyon*. Elsevier Ltd, 4(2), p. e00543. doi:
10.1016/j.heliyon.2018.e00543.

Saha, N. *et al.* (2017) 'Industrial metal pollution in water and probabilistic assessment of
human health risk', *Journal of Environmental Management*. Academic Press, 185, pp. 70–
78. doi: 10.1016/J.JENVMAN.2016.10.023.

Sigmund, G. *et al.* (2017) 'Biochar total surface area and total pore volume determined by
N2 and CO2 physisorption are strongly influenced by degassing temperature', *Science of the Total Environment.* Elsevier B.V., 580, pp. 770–775. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.12.023.

Silber, A. *et al.* (2010) 'PH-dependent mineral release and surface properties of cornstraw
biochar: Agronomic implications', *Environmental Science and Technology*, 44(24), pp. 9318–
9323. doi: 10.1021/es101283d.

Todd, Aaron Martin Lawrence; Robertson, Iain; Walsh, Rory P.D.; Byrne, Patrick; Edwards,
Paul; Williams, Tom (2021): Source Apportionment of Trace Metals at the Abandoned
Nantymwyn Lead-Zinc Mine, Wales. In: Wolkersdorfer, Ch., Stanley, P.; A.: IMWA21 - Mine
Water Management for Future Generations. Cardiff, Wales. Advance online publication

Trakal, L. *et al.* (2014) 'Geochemical and spectroscopic investigations of Cd and Pb sorption
mechanisms on contrasting biochars : Engineering implications', *Bioresource Technology*,
171, pp. 442–451. doi: 10.1016/j.biortech.2014.08.108.

Uchimiya, M., Lima, Isabel M, *et al.* (2010) 'Immobilization of Heavy Metal Ions (Cu II, Cd II,
Ni II, and Pb II) by Broiler Litter-Derived Biochars in Water and Soil', *Journal of Agriculture and Food Chemistry*, pp. 5538–5544. doi: 10.1021/jf9044217.

Uchimiya, M., Lima, Isabel M., *et al.* (2010) 'Immobilization of heavy metal ions (Cull, Cdll,
Nill, and PbII) by broiler litter-derived biochars in water and soil', *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 58(9), pp. 5538–5544. doi: 10.1021/jf9044217.

Uchimiya, M. et al. (2011) 'Screening biochars for heavy metal retention in soil : Role of oxygen functional groups', Journal of Hazardous Materials. Elsevier B.V., 190(1-3), pp. 432-441. doi: 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2011.03.063.

Wagner, S. et al. (2018) 'Tire wear particles in the aquatic environment - A review on generation, analysis, occurrence, fate and effects', Water Research, 139, pp. 83-100. doi: 10.1016/j.watres.2018.03.051.

Wang, Q. et al. (2018) 'Sorption and desorption of Pb(II) to biochar as affected by oxidation and pH', Science of The Total Environment. Elsevier B.V., 634(May), pp. 188-194. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.03.189.

Xu, R. kou and Zhao, A. zhen (2013) 'Effect of biochars on adsorption of Cu(II), Pb(II) and Cd(II) by three variable charge soils from southern China', Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 20(12), pp. 8491–8501. doi: 10.1007/s11356-013-1769-8.

Xu, X. et al. (2013) 'Comparison of rice husk- and dairy manure-derived biochars for simultaneously removing heavy metals from aqueous solutions: Role of mineral components in biochars', Chemosphere. Elsevier Ltd, 92(8), pp. 955-961. doi:

10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.03.009.

Yi, Y. et al. (2011) 'Ecological risk assessment of heavy metals in sediment and human health risk assessment of heavy metals in fishes in the middle and lower reaches of the Yangtze River basin', Environmental Pollution. Elsevier Ltd, 159(10), pp. 2575–2585. doi: 10.1016/j.envpol.2011.06.011.

Zhao, H. et al. (2010) 'Grain size distribution of road-deposited sediment and its contribution to heavy metal pollution in urban runoff in Beijing, China', Journal of Hazardous Materials. Elsevier B.V., 183(1-3), pp. 203-210. doi: 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2010.07.012.

1Highlights

- 2 The addition of wood ash to biochar increased metal removal by an order of
- 3 magnitude
- 4 Immobilisation is correlated to pH
- 5 Increased pH and the presence of minerals drive precipitation
- 6 Precipitation and ion exchange dominate immobilization
- 7 Wood ash amended biochar could remove heavy metals from motorway runoff



Author Statement

Stuart Cairns^a,: Conceptualization, Methodology, Investigation, Writing - Original Draft

Sampriti Chaudhuri^b, - Methodology, Investigation, Writing - Original Draft

Gabriel Sigmund^b, - Methodology, Writing - Review & Editing

lain Robertson^a, - Writing - Review & Editing

Natasha Hawkins^c, - Investigation

Tom Dunlop^d, - Investigation

Thilo Hofmann^{b-}Methodology, Writing - Review & Editing

1Declaration of competing interest

2The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal 3relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.