Editorial: Systematic Reviews in Marketing and International Business

Writing an Impactful Review Article: What do we know and What do we need to know?

Justin Paul

(University of Puerto Rico, San Juan, PR, USA)

Altaf Merchant

(University of Washington, Milgard School of Business, USA)

Yogesh K. Dwivedi

(School of Management, Swansea University Bay Campus, United Kingdom)

Gregory Rose

(University of Washington, Milgard School of Business, USA)

Abstract

Classic literature reviews help advance a subject area. In this article, we discuss the types of review articles and what kinds of review articles are likely to be impactful. In the case of theme- based reviews, we suggest that framework-based reviews that use a framework such as TCCM (Theory, Context, Characteristics, Methods) are generally more impactful than other types of reviews such as bibliometric reviews or narrative reviews. Reviews that develop classic theories are also very useful and insightful. Overall, successful review articles identify research gaps and set future research agenda.

Keywords: Framework, Systematic Review, Research Gap, Research Agenda, Bibliometric, Literature Review.

1. Introduction and Scope of Literature Reviews

Subject areas advance when studies are synthesized and research gaps are identified (Kumar, Paul & Unnithan, 2020). In this context, systematic literature reviews allow researchers to identify gaps in the literature, and critically examine prior literature in a transparent, rigorous and replicable manner (Snyder, 2019; Paul & Criado, 2020). The main purpose of a review article is to reconcile conflicting findings and suggest novel and new directions for a given field of research with reference to methodology, theory, constructs and contexts for others to examine using quantitative or qualitative methods (Canabal & White III, 2008; Hao et al., 2019).

There are different types of review articles. Theme-based reviews, theory-based reviews, reviews aiming for theory development and meta-analytical reviews (Paul & Criado, 2020). Paul and Criado (2020) in their article titled – The Art of writing literature review articles, provide useful information about review articles and classify them scientifically. There are several types of theme-based reviews which can be developed using different methodologies; i.e, theme-based reviews can be classified as: a) thematic reviews using a framework (framework-based reviews); b) bibliometric reviews; c) structured reviews without a framework; d) thematic reviews aiming for theory development with a new model and theoretic or testable proposition reviews; e) hybrid reviews, which integrates elements of bibliometric reviews and structured reviews; and f) narrative review (Paul & Criado, 2020; Paul et al., 2021).

Framework-based reviews are often informative, insightful and impactful. Here, authors write a review article that employs a framework like the 6W Framework developed by Callahan (2014) or the Theory, Characteristics, Context and Method (TCCM) framework developed by Paul &

Rosado-Serrano (2019) or the Antecedents, Decisions and Outcome framework developed by Paul & Benito (2018). Authors can use one of these frameworks or develop a framework of their own. Review articles using a structured framework are more likely to be accepted by editors and reviewers, and once published, such articles get a lot of downloads and citations. Xie, Reddy & Liang, (2017), for example, effectively used the 6W framework in a literature review article on cross-border acquisitions published in Journal of World Business.

Bibliometric reviews are relatively easy to develop since there are ready to use software packages such as VOS (Visualisation of Similarities) Viewer that help in preparing these reviews. Nevertheless, pure bibliometric reviews often do not capture the attention of young scholars because they focus primarily on citations and do not review specific theories, methods and constructs. Bibliometric reviews summarize citations, co-citations among authors, their universities, and their countries. A bird's eye view of review articles published in premier journals in the field, show that journals such as International Journal of Management Reviews and the Academy of Management review do not consider pure bibliometric reviews for publication in their journals.

2. Methodology and Structure of Review articles

One of the purposes of a review article is to provide novel and substantively interesting ideas and directions for researchers to undertake novel studies, rather than focusing on incremental and recycled types of research. Thus, it is important for researchers to have a 'state-of-the-art' understanding of research gaps in the topical domain. High quality, thematic reviews, bibliographic and meta-analyses can help provide a robust understanding to scholars and thus play an important role in a discipline's progress (Dwivedi et al., 2019; Jeyaraj & Dwivedi, 2020; Jones

& Gatrell, 2014; Palmatier, Houston & Hullund, 2018). In particular, the theory and methods of future business and management research could benefit from the insights that are revealed by systematic reviews. Hence, through this collection, we aim to enhance the understanding of business and management studies and their underpinnings, while helping to foster more novel paradigms.

It makes sense to point out some classic systematic literature review articles that have received thousands of downloads and hundreds of citations within two or three years after the publication. Theme based review with scientifically structured tables focused on widely used theories, constructs, methods (Canabal & White, 2008; Kahiya, 2018; Dabic et al, 2020; Dhaliwal, Singh & Paul, 2020; Rosado-Serrano et al., 2019; Mishra, Singh & Koles, 2021), Theory-based review (Gilal et al., 2019), meta-analytic review (Barrari et al., 2020; Dwivedi et al., 2019; Rana & Paul, 2020; Ismagilova et al., 2021), Hybrid review (Bibliometric review with the additional tables from content analysis, Goel & Kumar, 2020), review aiming for theory development (Paul & Mas, 2020) and Morphological review (Baliga et al., 2020).

In total, the editors of this special issue on literature reviews received over 140 submissions out of which we selected fourteen reviews for publication. Collectively, they cover ways of thinking that guide the subject areas, marketing and international business. Three of them are structured using a framework. For example, Chen, Mandler and Meyer-Warden (2021) use a Theory, Context, Characteristics and Methodology (TCCM), framework developed by Paul & Rosado-Serrano, (2019)- to examine the literature on loyalty programs. Some other papers in this special issue use Theory, Context, Methodology (TCM), or Antecedents, Decisions, Outcomes (ADO) frameworks (Paul & Benito, 2018). The papers included in our special issue on literature review articles are outlined and synthesized as follows:

2.1 Three Decades of Research on Loyalty Programs: A Literature Review and Future Research Agenda

The first article is titled, "Three decades of research on loyalty programs: A literature review and future research agenda" (Chen, Mandler & Meyer-Warden, 2021). The authors use the TCCM Framework (Paul & Rosado-Serrano, 2019) to structure their thematic review and to provide directions for future research with reference to theories, characteristics, contexts, and methods.

2.2 Home Sharing in Marketing and Tourism at a Tipping Point: What do we know, How do we know, and Where should we be heading?

Home shoring and hospitality sectors are at a tipping point. Taking into account such trends in this review article, Lim, Yap and Makkar (2021) synthesize the findings of prior studies on home sharing and tourism using two frameworks- the ADO framework (Paul & Benito, 2018) and the TCCM framework (Paul & Rosado-Serrano, 2019). The authors further integrate ADO and TCCM frameworks in their article and provide several ideas for future research, with reference to antecedents, decisions and outcomes. They also reviewed widely used theories, constructs and methods in prior studies in this domain.

2.3 Performance consequences of marketing standardization/adaptation: A systematic literature review and future research agenda

Despite extensive research into the standardization versus adaptation of international marketing processes and strategies, findings remain mixed and contradictory. In this context, Mandler, Sezen, Chen and Ozsomer (2021) review the literature in this area, identify research gaps and provide directions for future research. The entire article is structured using the TCCM Framework developed by Paul & Rosado-Serrano (2019).

2.4 Going on a Journey: A Review of Customer Journey Literature

Customer journey has become an increasingly important concept for understanding complex customer behaviors and deriving insights based on their experiences. In this context, Tueanrat, Papagiannidis and Alamanos (2021) reviewed the customer journey literature, highlight research gaps, and set a detailed agenda for future research. The article is both interesting and insightful.

2.5 The Evolving Role of Artificial Intelligence in Marketing: A Review and Research Agenda

Artificial intelligence plays an increasingly important role in marketing, especially in the wake of the COVID 19 crisis. Considering the increasing importance of artificial intelligence, Vlacic, Corbo, Silva and Dabic (2021) review the literature in this area, specify gaps in the literature and suggest pathways for future research. This article can be considered as a hybrid review.

2.6 Forty-five Years of Celebrity Credibility and Endorsement Literature: Review and Learnings

Celebrity credibility constitutes an important part of the celebrity brand endorsement literature. In other words, it can be stated that endorsements by celebrities help build a brand. There are hundreds of studies in the area of celebrity endorsements. Halden, Pradhan and Chaudhary (2021) review prior studies in this area covering 45 years of research.

2.7 A Broad Overview of Interactive Digital Marketing: A Bibliometric Network Analysis.

Digital marketing is in the limelight these days. Considering the importance of digital marketing, Krishen, Dwivedi, Bindu and Kumar (2021) provide a broad overview of interactive digital marketing in the article titled – A broad overview of interactive digital marketing.

2.8 The Determinants of SMEs' Export Entry: A Systematic Review of the Literature

Small and Medium scale industries play an important role in all countries. Many of them are involved in exports as part of their effort to achieve international competitiveness. In this systematic literature review (SLR), Haddoud, Onejwu, Nowinski and Jones (2021) synthesize the literature and provide insightful directions for future research with reference to theory, constructs and methods.

2.9 International Entrepreneurial Orientation (IEO): A Bibliometric Overview of Scholarly Research

International entrepreneurship is an important research area and there are several journals publishing research in this area. This bibliometric review by Gupta, Pandey and Sebastian (2021) provides information about the most influential articles and authors in the area of international entrepreneurial orientation (IEO). In addition, the paper classifies the sub-domain topics researched in the broad area of IEO. Besides, authors review the theoretical foundations of this emerging field and identify future research opportunities in IEO.

2.10 Institutions, Institutional Quality, and International Competitiveness: Review and Examination of Future Research Directions

International competitiveness is very important and critical for success in international business. It also helps firms to survive and succeed in the long run. Therefore, researchers have done lot of research in this area. In this review article, Bultrago and Camargo (2021) review research studies and link three related constructs: institutions, institutional quality and international competitiveness.

2.11 Service Failure and Recovery in B2B Markets – A Morphological Analysis

The existing body of research on service failures and recoveries primarily deals with business-to-consumer markets, with relatively limited and scattered research on business-to-business (B2B) markets. Baliga, Chawla, Sunder, Ganesh and Sivakumaran (2020) review the existing literature on these failures and recoveries in B2B markets, conceptualize and develop a morphological analysis (MA) framework, and identify research gaps that point to future research possibilities.

2.12 B2B Market Segmentation: A Systematic Review and Research Agenda

Segmenting industrial markets is a key challenge for the marketing field. More than 30 years of research has not produced comprehensive guidelines for developing robust B2B market segments; only a few studies have empirically tested the impact of segmentation and the literature today appears to be more fragmented than earlier. Cortez, Clarke and Freytag (2021) develop a three-layer framework comprised of: (1) conceptualization of B2B market segmentation, (2) segmentation as a process, and (3) context.

2.13 Information Disclosure in E-commerce: A Systematic Review and Agenda for Future Research

It is often necessary for consumers to disclose their private information to merchants when shopping online despite their privacy concerns. Such practices have become more prevalent in the last two decades due to rapid growth and widespread adoption of electronic commerce and social commerce applications. Although such disclosure is valuable for business, understanding why, how, and with what outcomes consumers decide to share their information is generally fragmented and inconclusive. Considering this as a motivation, Kolotylo-Kulkarni, Xia & Dhillon (2021) reviewed and integrated extent literature on this topic to understand the meaning of the term information disclosure, and its conceptual foundations, methodologies, dimensions, antecedents,

and consequences in the context of e-commerce. This review article has presented an integrated theoretical model with associated research propositions, in order to set clear directions for future research related to consumers' information disclosure in e-commerce.

2.14 Fake News, Social Media and Marketing: A Systematic Review

The role of social media in spreading misinformation (known as 'Fake News') is a growing concern, which has been widely discussed. Although such issues are being examined, existing research efforts have mainly focused on misinformation and fake news for political communication (see for example, Grover et al., 2019) or in relation to a disaster or the pandemic (see for example, Bunker, 2020; Dwivedi et al., 2020). Relatively less attention has been paid to understanding the implications of social media misinformation for marketing and consumer behavior. Considering such a gap in the literature as a motivation, Di Domenico, Sit, Ishizaka & Nunan (2021) conduct an interdisciplinary systematic review that identifies five themes that can be used to explain the fake news phenomenon. These five themes of social media misinformation marketing are discussed in this article: the dissemination process, spreading channel features, outcomes, fabricated legitimacy and attitudes. This review article has presented a theoretical framework along with corresponding research propositions to guide future research in this fast-emerging area.

3.0   Conclusion

This special edition includes 14 articles that utilize a number of different methodologies and examine a variety topic areas, including customer loyalty programs, home sharing in marketing and tourism, international entrepreneur orientation, adaptation versus standardization and the entry strategy of small and medium size firms in international marketing, the emerging role of artificial

intelligence and digital marketing, celebrity credibility in endorsements, the link between institutions and institutional quality and international competitiveness, service failure and market segmentation in B2B marketing, information disclosure in e-commerce, and the impact of fake news on marketing and consumer behavior. Together these topics provide a partial representation of the varied and complex topics studied by marketing scholars. Collectively, these articles synthesize the research in these areas and provide directions for future research. Impactful review articles help to move a discipline forward, are needed in marketing, and can assist a discipline in identify important topics for future examination.

References:

Baliga, A. J., Chawla, V., Ganesh, L. S., & Sivakumaran, B. (2020). Service Failure and Recovery in B2B Markets–A Morphological Analysis. *Journal of Business Research*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2020.09.025

Barari, M., Ross, M., Thaichon, S., & Surachartkumtonkun, J. (2020). A meta-analysis of customer engagement behaviour. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*. https://doi.org/10.1111/ijcs.12609

Bunker, D. (2020). Who do you trust? The digital destruction of shared situational awareness and the COVID-19 infodemic. *International Journal of Information Management*, *55*, 102201.

Canabal, A., & White III, G. O. (2008). Entry mode research: Past and future. *International Business Review*, *17*(3), 267-284.

Callahan, J. L. (2014). Writing literature reviews: A reprise and update. https://doi.org/10.1177/1534484314536705.

Camargo, M. I. & Bultrago, R. (2021). Institutions, institutional quality, and international competitiveness: Review and examination of future research directions. *Journal of Business Research*, *128*, 423-435.

Chen, Y., Mandler, T., & Meyer-Waarden, L. (2021). Three decades of research on loyalty programs: A literature review and future research agenda. *Journal of Business Research*, *124*, 179-197.

Dabić, M., Vlačić, B., Paul, J., Dana, L. P., Sahasranamam, S., & Glinka, B. (2020). Immigrant entrepreneurship: A review and research agenda. *Journal of Business Research*, *113*, 25-38.

Di Domenico, G., Sit, J., Ishizaka, A., & Nunan, D. (2021). Fake news, social media and marketing: A systematic review. *Journal of Business Research*, *124*, 329-341.

Dhaliwal, A., Singh, D. P., & Paul, J. (2020). The consumer behavior of luxury goods: A review and research agenda. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 1-27. https://doi.org/10.1080/0965254X.2020.1758198

Dwivedi, Y. K., Hughes, D. L., Coombs, C., Constantiou, I., Duan, Y., Edwards, J. S., & Upadhyay, N. (2020). Impact of COVID-19 pandemic on information management research and practice: Transforming education, work and life. *International Journal of Information Management*, *55*, 102211.

Dwivedi, Y. K., Rana, N. P., Jeyaraj, A., Clement, M., & Williams, M. D. (2019). Re-examining the unified theory of acceptance and use of technology (UTAUT): Towards a revised theoretical model. *Information Systems Frontiers*, *21*(3), 719-734.

Gilal, F. G., Zhang, J., Paul, J., & Gilal, N. G. (2019). The role of self-determination theory in marketing science: An integrative review and agenda for research. *European Management Journal*, *37*(1), 29-44.

Goyal, K., & Kumar, S. (2021). Financial literacy: A systematic review and bibliometric analysis. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, *45*(1), 80-105.

Gupta, R., Pandey, R., & Sebastian, V. J. (2021). International Entrepreneurial Orientation (IEO): A bibliometric overview of scholarly research. *Journal of Business Research*, *125*, 74-88.

Grover, P., Kar, A. K., Dwivedi, Y. K., & Janssen, M. (2019). Polarization and acculturation in US Election 2016 outcomes–Can twitter analytics predict changes in voting preferences. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, *145*, 438-460.

Haddoud, M. Y., Onjewu, A. K. E., Nowiński, W., & Jones, P. (2021). The determinants of SMEs' export entry: A systematic review of the literature. *Journal of Business Research*, *125*, 262-278.

Halder, D., Pradhan, D., & Chaudhuri, H. R. (2021). Forty-five years of celebrity credibility and endorsement literature: Review and learnings. *Journal of Business Research*, *125*, 397-415.

Hao, A. W., Paul, J., Trott, S., Guo, C., & Wu, H.-H. (2019). Two decades of research on nation branding: A review and future research agenda. *International Marketing Review*. https://doi.org/10.1108/IMR-01-2019-0028

Ismagilova, E., Rana, N. P., Slade, E. L., & Dwivedi, Y. K. (2021). A meta-analysis of the factors affecting eWOM providing behaviour. *European Journal of Marketing*, *55(4)*, 1067-1102.

Jeyaraj, A., & Dwivedi, Y. K. (2020). Meta-analysis in information systems research: Review and recommendations. *International Journal of Information Management*, *55*, 102226.

Jones, O., & Gatrell, C. (2014). Editorial: The future of writing and reviewing for IJMR. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, *16*(3), 249-264.

Kahiya, E. T. (2018). Five decades of research on export barriers: Review and future directions. *International Business Review*, *27*(6), 1172-1188.

Krishen, A. S., Dwivedi, Y. K., Bindu, N., & Kumar, K. S. (2021). A broad overview of interactive digital marketing: A bibliometric network analysis. *Journal of Business Research*, *131*, 183-195.

Kolotylo-Kulkarni, M., Xia, W., & Dhillon, G. (2021). Information disclosure in e-commerce: A systematic review and agenda for future research. *Journal of Business Research*, *126*, 221-238.

Kumar, A., Paul, J., & Unnithan, A. (2020). 'Masstige' marketing: A review, synthesis and research agenda. *Journal of Business Research*. *113*, May, 384-398.

Lim, W. M., Yap, S. F., & Makkar, M. (2021). Home sharing in marketing and tourism at a tipping point: What do we know, how do we know, and where should we be heading? *Journal of Business Research*, *122*, 534-566.

Mandler, T., Sezen, B., Chen, J., & Özsomer, A. (2021). Performance consequences of marketing standardization/adaptation: A systematic literature review and future research agenda. *Journal of Business Research*, *125*, 416-435.

Mishra, R., Singh, R. K., & Koles, B. (2021). Consumer decision-making in Omnichannel retailing: Literature review and future research agenda. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 45(2), 147-174.

Palmatier, R. W., Houston, M. B., & Hulland, J. (2018). Review articles: purpose, process, and structure. *Journal of Academy of Marketing Science*, *46*(1), 1-5.

Paul, J., & Benito, G. R. (2018). A review of research on outward foreign direct investment from emerging countries, including China: what do we know, how do we know and where should we be heading?. *Asia Pacific Business Review*, *24*(1), 90-115.

Paul, J., & Criado, A. R. (2020). The art of writing literature review: What do we know and what do we need to know?. *International Business Review*, *29*(4), 101717.

Paul, J., & Rosado-Serrano, A. (2019). Gradual internationalization vs born-global/international new venture models. *International Marketing Review*. 36 (6), 830-858.

Paul, J., Lim.W.M, O'Cass, A., Hao, A.W & Bresciani, S. (2021). Scientific Procedures and Rationales for Systematic Literature Reviews (SPAR-4-SLR). *International Journal of Consumer studies.* https://doi.org/10.1111/ijcs.12695.

Paul, J., & Mas, E. (2020). Toward a 7-P framework for international marketing. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, *28*(8), 681-701.

Rana, J., & Paul, J. (2019). Health motive and the purchase of organic food: A meta-analytic review. International Journal of Consumer Studies. 44(2), 161-172 https://doi.org/10.1111/ijcs.12556

Rosado-Serrano, A., Paul, J. & Dikova, D (2018). International franchising: A literature review and research agenda. Journal of Business Research, 85, 238-257. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2017.12.049

Snyder, H. (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, *104*, 333-339.

Tueanrat, Y., Papagiannidis, S., & Alamanos, E. (2021). Going on a journey: A review of the customer journey literature. *Journal of Business Research*, *125*, 336-353.

Vlačić, B., Corbo, L., e Silva, S. C., & Dabić, M. (2021). The evolving role of artificial intelligence in marketing: A review and research agenda. *Journal of Business Research*, *128*, 187-203.

Xie, E., Reddy, K. S., & Liang, J. (2017). Country-specific determinants of cross-border mergers and acquisitions: A comprehensive review and future research directions. *Journal of World Business*, *52*(2), 127-183.

About the Authors / Editors:

Dr Justin Paul serves as Editor-in-chief of A ranked International Journal of Consumer studies, and as an Associate Editor of Journal of Business Research. A former faculty member with the University of Washington, he is a Full Professor of PhD & MBA programs, University of Puerto Rico, USA. He holds three honorary titles as 'Distinguished Professor' with three reputed universities including- Indian Institute of Management (IIM-K), and SIBM, Pune.
He is known as an author/co-author of best-selling books such as Business Environment, International Marketing, Services Marketing, Export-Import Management, Management of Banking & Financial Services by McGraw-Hill, Oxford University Press & Pearson respectively. Dr. Paul introduced the Masstige model and measure for brand management, CPP Model for internationalization, SCOPE framework for Small firms and 7-P Framework for International Marketing. His articles have been downloaded over 800,000 times. An author of over 120 research papers in SSCI journals, Justin has over 70 papers are in A or A star journals. He has also served as an associate professor at Nagoya University, Japan and as Department Chair at IIM. He has been a visiting professor at Aarhus University- Denmark, Grenoble Eco le de

Management-& University of Versailles -France, University-Lithuania, Warsaw -Poland, Austria, Spain, Croatia, China, Chicago-USA, Barcelona and Madrid (Spain) and has published three best- selling case studies with Ivey & Harvard.

Dr Altaf Merchant is the Gary E. and James A. Milgard Endowed Dean and Professor of Marketing at the Milgard School of Business. He is a Visiting Professor at the University of Lorraine, and the Aix-Marseille University in France, Senior Research Fellow at the King's College (UK) and Distinguished Professor in Residence at MICA School of Strategic Marketing in India. His research focuses on advertising, branding, cross-cultural and non-profit marketing issues.

Dr Yogesh K. Dwivedi is a Professor of Digital Marketing and Innovation, Founding Director of the Emerging Markets Research Centre (EMaRC) and Co-Director of Research at the School of Management, Swansea University, Wales, UK. Professor Dwivedi is also currently leading the International Journal of Information Management as its Editor-in-Chief. His research interests are at the interface of Information Systems (IS) and Marketing, focusing on issues related to consumer adoption and diffusion of emerging digital innovations, digital government, and digital and social media marketing particularly in the context of emerging markets. Professor Dwivedi has published more than 300 articles in a range of leading academic journals and conferences that are widely cited (more than 24 thousand times as per Google Scholar). Professor Dwivedi is an Associate Editor of the Journal of Business Research, European Journal of Marketing, Government Information Quarterly and International Journal of Electronic Government Research, and Senior Editor of the Journal of Electronic Commerce Research. More information about Professor Dwivedi can be found at: http://www.swansea.ac.uk/staff/som/academic-staff/y.k.dwivedi/

Dr Gregoy M. Rose is a Professor of Marketing at the University of Washington Tacoma Milgard School of Business. His research interest include branding, brand heritage, consumer socialization, and cross-cultural consumer behavior. His research has appeared in several leading journals including the J*ournal of Business Research, the Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science, the Journal of Consumer Research, the Journal of Consumer Psychology, Psychology and Marketing, the Journal of Marketing,* and the several other journals and conferences.