



Cronfa - Swansea University Open Access Repository

This is an author produced version of a paper published in: *Climatic Change*

Cronfa URL for this paper: http://cronfa.swan.ac.uk/Record/cronfa50940

Paper:

Rivas, M., Esteban, N. & Marco, A. (2019). Potential male leatherback hatchlings exhibit higher fitness which might balance sea turtle sex ratios in the face of climate change. *Climatic Change* http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10584-019-02462-1

This item is brought to you by Swansea University. Any person downloading material is agreeing to abide by the terms of the repository licence. Copies of full text items may be used or reproduced in any format or medium, without prior permission for personal research or study, educational or non-commercial purposes only. The copyright for any work remains with the original author unless otherwise specified. The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holder.

Permission for multiple reproductions should be obtained from the original author.

Authors are personally responsible for adhering to copyright and publisher restrictions when uploading content to the repository.

http://www.swansea.ac.uk/library/researchsupport/ris-support/

Manuscript

| 1 | 1 | Potential male leatherback hatchlings exhibit higher fitness and might balance sea | | | | | | |
|----------------------|----|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| 1 2 3 4 | 2 | turtle sex ratios in the face of climate change | | | | | | |
| 5 6 7 | 3 | Marga L. Rivas ^{a,b} , Nicole Esteban ^c and Adolfo Marco ^d | | | | | | |
| 8 9 10 11 | 4 | | | | | | | |
| 12 13 14 | 5 | ^a Nature and Oceans of the Americas NGO, Avda. 11, San José, Costa Rica | | | | | | |
| 15 16 17 | 6 | ^b Department of Biology, Marta Abreu de Las Villas University, Cuba | | | | | | |
| 18 19 | 7 | ^c Bioscience Department, Swansea University, Wales, SA2 8PP, United Kingdom | | | | | | |
| 20 21 22 | 8 | ^d Department of Conservation of Biodiversity, Estación Biológica de Doñana, CSIC, C/Américo | | | | | | |
| 23 24 | 9 | Vespucio s/n, 41092, Seville, Spain | | | | | | |
| 25 26 27 | 10 | | | | | | | |
| 28 29 | 11 | | | | | | | |
| 30 31 32 33 | 12 | | | | | | | |
| 34 35 36 | 13 | Keywords: climate change, conservation, endangered species, global warming, incubation | | | | | | |
| 37 38 39 | 14 | period, marine turtles, reproductive output. | | | | | | |
| 40 41 42 | 15 | Running head: Higher fitness of male hatchlings | | | | | | |
| 43 44 45 46 | 16 | | | | | | | |
| 47 48 | 17 | *Corresponding author: Marga L Rivas. Department of Biology, Marta Abreu de Las Villas | | | | | | |
| 49 50 51 52 | 18 | University, Cuba. Email: mrivas@ual.es. Tlf: 34609694995 | | | | | | |
| 53 | 19 | | | | | | | |
| 54 55 | 20 | | | | | | | |
| 56 | 21 | | | | | | | |
| э/ 58 | 22 | | | | | | | |
| 59 60 | 23 | | | | | | | |
| 60 61 | | | | | | | | |
| 62 63 | | | | | | | | |
| 64 | | | | | | | | |
| 65 | | | | | | | | |

Abstract

Sea turtles are vertebrates with temperature-dependent sex determination (TSD). Rising temperatures (as a results of climate change) cause biased female sex ratios. Here we assess the influence of depth and shading conditions on nest temperatures and hatchling fitness of leatherbacks. We relocated 48 clutches into a hatchery from 2013 to 2015. 24 clutches were placed under shade and 24 under sun at 3 depths (50, 75, 90 cm). Leatherback hatchling fitness (as measured by greater length, width and weight) and locomotion performance (faster crawling and shorter righting responses) was improved in clutches from cooler, shaded treatments. At 50 cm depth, hatching success was higher for shaded clutches (78.6%±14.6) than unshaded (49.2%±36.4). Our results showed that shaded conditions produced hatchlings with higher fitness and a high likelihood of being males. Therefore, it may be used to inform conservation policies to decrease the current female-skewed sex ratio production caused by rising temperatures at most nesting rookeries around the world.

1. Introduction

It is predicted that human activities will cause an increase of over 1.5 °C in the global average temperature by the end of the 21st century (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), 2013). This rapid and significant increase in mean temperature could exacerbate the extinction risk of species exhibiting temperature-dependent sex determination by femininizing their populations. However, climate change episodes might vary among places and some populations might be more affected by climatic events than others (Fernández-Chacón et al. 2011; Wernberg et al. 2013; Santidrián Tomillo et al. 2015). For example, temperatures are predicted to increase at higher rates in tropical locations than in the temperate zones with an associated effect on sea turtle hatchling production (Pike et al. 2013, 2015).

Sea turtles are temperature-dependent sex determination species (TSD) (Mrosovsky and Pieau 1991), with female production at high temperatures and males at low ones (Yntema and Mrosovsky 1980). Hence, increasing temperatures produce biased female sex ratios (Godfrey et al. 1996; Hawkes et al. 2007; Fuentes et al. 2009; Woolgar et al. 2013) and mortality of embryos and hatchlings within the nest (Santidrián Tomillo et al. 2012, 2014). In addition, increases in storm intensity may cause consistent precipitation during incubation in some places (Webster et al. 2005) that might increase the moisture content of the sand, decreasing the optimum conditions required for embryonic development (Mcgehee 1990; Van Houtan and Bass 2007; Patino-Martinez et al. 2014), and consequently, increasing mortality of embryos (Rivas et al. 2018). Rises in water table level due to sea level rise could also induce clutch mortality by prolonged tidal inundation, suffocation (Kraemer and Bell 1980; Rivas et al. 2016a) and decrease optimal incubation temperature.

Incubation conditions of turtle clutches depend on nest depth and the shading level of
the sand surface over the nest (Patiño et al. 2012; Jourdan and Fuentes 2013; Wyneken and

Lolavar 2015). Cooler nests will have longer incubation periods and embryos will have more
time to develop which might affect their future phenotype (Glen et al. 2003). Phenotypical
hatchling characteristics may play an important role in their survivorship (Janzen et al. 2000)
(i.e. increases in nest temperature decreases swimming abilities of hatchlings) (Booth and
Evans 2011). Some studies have identified that hatchling morphological characteristics and
locomotor performances such as righting response and crawling time (Delmas et al. 2007)
could be correlated with survival.

Besides the effect of climate change on the female productivity due to temperature (Matsuzawa et al. 2002; Santidrian et al. 2012, 2017; Pike et al. 2013) and precipitation (Houghton et al. 2007; Saba et al. 2012; Rivas et al. 2018), hatchling success and fitness can also be influenced by other physical and environmental conditions such as vegetation (Standora and Spotila 1985; Rivas et al. 2016b), partial pressures of oxygen, pO2 (Garrett et al. 2010) and moisture (Wyneken and Lolavar 2015). Considering that climatic models predict increases in mean temperature, intense tropical cyclone activity, and heavy precipitation events for the next decades (IPCC 2013), research that is focused on studying the effect of these climatic variations is important to predict how they might affect the reproductive output and hatchling fitness of TSD species such as leatherback sea turtles, Dermochelys coriacea.

Here, we present the results of a coordinated experiment to examine the influence of incubation temperature on the fitness of hatchlings from leatherback turtle clutches relocated to a hatchery. We recorded (i) mean temperature (ii) hatching success and (iii) hatchling fitness of nests incubated in different environmental conditions. We evaluated hatchling fitness by measuring their morphological characteristics and locomotor performance (righting response and crawling behaviour). Hatchling fitness could be an important estimator of

survivorship during early life-history stage as well as to assess hatchling survival under future
scenarios of climate change.

2. Methods

94 2.1 Study site

The study was conducted at Pacuare beach located in the Pacuare Nature Reserve (PNR) (10°10′00″N, 83°14′00″W) on the Caribbean coast of Costa Rica, which hosts one of the highest density of nests per km in Central America (Rivas et al. 2016c). Leatherback turtle nesting season at PNR is March-July where recent population trends have been stable (Rivas et al. 2016c) similar to other Caribbean populations (Dutton et al. 2005; Girondot et al. 2007; Stewart et al. 2011).

101 2.2 *Experimental treatments – hatching success and incubation temperature*

To determine the effect of the incubation temperature on hatchling success and fitness, we relocated 48 nests per year to a beach hatchery during 3 nesting seasons (2013-2015). The hatchery was located close to the coastal vegetation in the same location each year with dimensions of 10 x 8 m on a 0° slope, delimited by 1 m depth and 1 m high fence. To obtain different incubation temperatures, 50% of the hatchery (10 x 4 m) was shaded and 50% was **107** fully exposed to the sun. Shade was created using a black plastic mesh installed at 1.5 m height, allowing 40% sun radiation at 1.5 m above the sand. Clutches were placed at three depth treatments at 50, 75 and 90 cm of depth in a block design considering depth range of in situ nests at PNR (74.6 ± 7.2 cm, Min = 40, Max = 97.3 cm, n = 368) in 2012. Eight clutches were randomly assigned to each depth and shade treatments. Nests were relocated to the hatchery immediately after female oviposition. The maximum distance of transportation of nests was 800 m within an hour after laying. A random sample of 20 eggs per clutch was

measured with calipers. Egg clutches were buried in the hatchery in nests mimicking the shape of natural excavation chambers. Clutches of eggs were covered by returning sand in the same order as it was removed to maintain original sand moisture and grain size.

⁸ 117 To record sand and incubation temperatures, data loggers Hobo StowAway Tidbit v2 ¹⁰ 118 ($\pm 0.2 \,^{\circ}$ C) or Hobo Pendant 8K-UA-001-08 ($\pm 0.5 \,^{\circ}$ C) were used. A data logger was placed in ¹² 119 the middle of each clutch for every depth and shading treatment to record incubation ¹⁴ temperature. A second logger was buried at the same depth 1 m from each clutch to record ¹⁷ 121 sand temperature. All loggers recorded temperature every 30 min during the entire incubation ¹⁹ period. Temperatures from 2015 were not included in the analysis because clutches at 75 and ²⁰ 123 90 cm depths did not hatch due to inundation.

The incubation period was considered as the number of days elapsed between egg burial and emergence of the first hatchling. Before hatching, a cylindrical metal net was located on every nest to keep emerged hatchlings. All clutches were excavated two days after hatchling emergence to determine the number of dead eggs and dead hatchlings within the nest chamber. Hatching success was estimated as the proportion of eggs that produced hatchlings in a clutch using the equation: H = S/(S + U), where S = number of eggshells and U = number of unhatched eggs. Eggshell fragments that represented $\geq 50\%$ of the egg were considered as one hatched egg (Miller 1999).

The mean nest temperature during the middle trimester (the thermosensitive period) (Rimblot
et al. 1985) was calculated and sex ratio was estimated as the mean nest temperature in that 2week period multiplied by the proportion of nests incubating in that period. Sex ratios were
estimated using curves relating incubation temperature to sex ratio for Pacific Costa Rican
leatherback turtles (Chevalier et al. 1999), the closest rookery to our study site with available
data. However, temperature fluctuations might infer sex ratios in natural nests (Neuwald and

Valenzuela 2011), therefore, means were considered as potential indicator of sex ratio,
although considering that these may create a male-bias of sex ratio estimations (Girondot et
al. 2018).

141 2.3 Hatchling fitness: phenotype and locomotor performance

Immediately after emergence, hatchlings were taken from cylindrical nets and placed in **143** buckets for measurement and assessment of locomotor performance. To assess the effect of the incubation temperature on hatchling fitness, we measured size and mass of hatchlings, body temperature, and locomotor performance. A sample of 20 hatchlings was randomly selected and measured from each successful clutch. Hatchling straight carapace length (SCL) and straight carapace width (SCW) were measured with callipers to the nearest 0.1 cm. Hatchling mass was weighted using a microbalance (PK401 Denver Instrument, accuracy \pm 0.1 g). The index of physical condition was determined as the ratio between hatchling masses to the length of the carapace (g mm⁻¹) (Van de Merwe et al. 2005). The body temperature of the plastron surface of hatchlings (n = 10) from each nest was measured by an infrared laser thermometer (FLUKE, 561, laser < 1mW Clase II, 630-670 nm, -40° - 550°C, accuracy $\pm 1.0^{\circ}$ C) from a distance of +-20 cm.

Hatchling righting response was estimated as the time that it takes for an individual to return to an upright position after being placed on its carapace (Steyermark and Spotila 2001). For each righting trial, a hatchling (n = 10) from each nest was placed on a flat table and was tested for 2 min as the maximum time for self-righting. Trials were performed on 10 hatchlings per clutch.

159 Crawling rate by hatchlings was estimated by releasing groups of 5 on the sand from 160 several distances to record the time to reach a marked line at high tide level. Prior to this trial, 161 the beach was cleared of debris or any obstacles that could affect hatchling movement. To

quantify crawling rates by hatchlings, immediately after the righting response test the groups of 20 hatchlings per clutch were then released on the beach in groups of 5 from distances of 30, 20, 10 and 5 m to the marked line. To reach significant numbers, the remainder of emerged hatchlings were added to this trial to assess whether groups of hatchlings could influence crawling rate. However, it was considered that results could be biased since some hatchlings in the groups were subjected to two previous trials. 34 groups (each with 20 hatchlings) were released at 10 m from the marked line. Time was recorded to reach the marked line for: the first hatchling (t0), half of the group (t1) and final hatchling (t2).

2.4 Statistics

We used general linear modelling (GLM) to investigate the effect of depth, shading and year on hatching success and hatchling fitness. To avoid pseudo replication, mean hatchling measurements were estimated per nest. We used two-way ANOVA and egg weight as covariants to assess whether shade treatments and depth determined carapace size, weight, body temperature, righting response and crawling time. Finally, multiple regression analysis was performed to correlate egg mass and hatchling fitness, which would be used to assess the influence of depth and shade treatments on hatchling fitness and locomotor performance (Booth, Feeney and Shibata 2013). The analyses were performed using Jaguar library and R commander in R, version 3.3.3 (Rcore Team 2017) and STATISTICA v. 7.0 (StatSoft, Inc. Tulsa USA).

3. Results

3.1 Experimental treatments-hatching success and incubation temperature

The temperatures recorded in the centre of the clutch and the sand at the same depth and close to the nest differed on an average of 1.1 ± 0.2 °C (Mean \pm SD) due to the embryonic

| 185 | metabolic heating. The mean clutch temperature was of 28.7 ± 0.5 °C in shaded clutches and |
|-----|---|
| 186 | 31.4 ± 0.6 °C in unshaded clutches (Table 1). The mean clutch temperature during the |
| 187 | thermosensitive period (the second trimester of embryonic development) under shade |
| 188 | treatment was 28.0 \pm 0.4 °C and 31.0 \pm 0.67 °C under the sun. A mean incubation temperature |
| 189 | of 28.0 °C corresponds to an estimated sex-ratio highly biased toward males (100%), while a |
| 190 | mean incubation temperature of 31.4 °C corresponds to an estimated sex-ratio highly biased |
| 191 | to females (100%) (Chevalier et al. 1999). We also found significant differences in the |
| 192 | incubation period between both treatments (F = 6.5, $p < 0.001$). The average incubation |
| 193 | duration of unshaded clutches was shorter (61 ± 2.1 days, N = 29 clutches than shaded |
| 194 | clutches (74.8 \pm 5.3, N = 26 days) (Table S1). The mean size and weight of eggs were of |
| 195 | $(53.1 \pm 2.0 \text{ mm}, n = 143) (49.0 - 65.6) \text{ and } (92.4 \pm 6.9 \text{ gr}, n = 143) (74.6 - 111.2)$ |
| 196 | respectively. Significant differences were found on egg size among years (GLM test, F = |
| 197 | 34.7, $p < 0.001$). Significant differences were also found in hatching success among depths |
| 198 | (GLM test, F = 10.13, p = 0.006), years (F = 38.98, p < 0.001) and shade treatments (F = |
| 199 | 12.02, $p = 0.002$) (Fig. 1). The Tukey post-hoc analysis showed a higher survival on clutches |
| 200 | at 50 cm depth compared with nests at deeper treatments. Inundation by groundwater caused |
| 201 | a very high mortality in clutches buried at 75 and 90 cm depth. At 50 cm, where the impact of |
| 202 | inundation was very low, shaded clutches had a higher survival than unshaded (78.6 ± 14.6 |
| 203 | %, 49.19 ± 36.4 %, respectively). In constrast, at 90 cm, in 2013-2014 was (20.2± 23.19 % |
| 204 | shaded, 30.04 ± 31.75 % unshaded). |
| 205 | |

3.2 Hatchling fitness: phenotype and locomotor performance

The mean SCL of hatchlings was of $60.0 \pm 2.0 \text{ mm}$ (N = 94, range= 55.2 - 63.9) and showed significant differences among shade treatments (Table 1) and year (F = 10.5, p = 0.005) (Fig. 2). The Tukey post-hoc analysis showed differences between 50 cm depth clutches between

| 210 | shade treatments in 2013 and 2014 (p < 0.001). The mean SCW of hatchlings was 41.3 ± 2.3 | | | | | |
|-----|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| 211 | mm (N = 94, range= $38.2 - 59.2$) with no significant differences between treatments | | | | | |
| 212 | (depth*shade treatments; $p = 0.14$) but the Tukey post-hoc analysis showed differences in | | | | | |
| 213 | SCW between clutches at 50 cm depth and clutches at 75 and 90 cm (F= 82.0, $p < 0.001$). | | | | | |
| 214 | The mean weight of hatchlings was 48.9 ± 6.4 g (N = 94, range = 24.4 - 59.2) and varied | | | | | |
| 215 | among shade treatments (Table 1) (Fig. 2). Post-hoc analysis showed differences between 50 | | | | | |
| 216 | and 75 and 90 cm depth clutches (F = 34.4, $p < 0.001$). Overall, the mean SCL, SCW and | | | | | |
| 217 | weight of hatchlings in shaded clutches were higher than without shade (F = 236.6, $p < 0.001$; | | | | | |
| 218 | F = 122.5, $p < 0.001$; $F = 52.8$, $p < 0.001$), respectively (Fig. 3). The egg mass and the | | | | | |
| 219 | physical condition index were positively correlated ($p = 0.004$). The hatchling physical | | | | | |
| 220 | condition index (mean of 0.8 ± 0.1) did not vary significantly among depths and shade | | | | | |
| 221 | treatments (Table 1; Fig.4). The body temperature of hatchlings did not vary significantly | | | | | |
| 222 | among depths and shade treatments (F = 2.13, p = 0.34; F = 2.32, p = 0.470, respectively). | | | | | |
| 223 | The analysis of locomotor performance of hatchlings revealed significant differences | | | | | |
| 224 | in the righting response between the shading treatments (F = 6.7, $p < 0.001$). Post-hoc | | | | | |
| 225 | analysis showed differences at 50 cm with respect to 75 and 90 cm depth (F = 4.8, $p < 0.001$) | | | | | |
| 226 | (Fig. 5). The crawling time of hatchlings was significantly different between the shade | | | | | |
| 227 | treatments (p < 0.001), but not between depths (F = 0.87, p = 0.650). Post-hoc analysis | | | | | |
| 228 | showed differences between 50 and 75 and 90 cm (F = 4.4, $p < 0.001$). Hatchlings emerging | | | | | |
| 229 | from shaded clutches were faster than those from unshaded clutches (5.9 ± 3.9 ; 7.2 ± 4.6 | | | | | |
| 230 | respectively) (Fig.6, Table 1), but there were no differences among distances ($F = 7.0$, $p =$ | | | | | |
| 231 | 0.07). Finally, the results comparing crawling time over 10 m distance by groups of | | | | | |
| 232 | hatchlings (t0: 2.5 ± 1.0 , t1: 3.4 ± 1.3 , t2: 5.4 ± 2.1 min, n = 33) did not show significant | | | | | |
| 233 | differences among depths and between shade treatments ($P = 0.02$; $P = 0.13$; $P = 0.86$, | | | | | |
| 234 | respectively). | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |

This study highlights that hatchlings from cooler nests have a higher fitness in terms of locomotor performance and ability to right themselves. In the last years many studies have shown an increased concern on the potential effects of global warming to many TSD species such as reptiles (Hulin et al. 2009; Hawkes et al. 2009; Pike et al. 2014; Santidrian et al. 2015), fishes (Ospina-Alvarez et al. 2010) and birds (Mitchell et al. 2010; Grayson et al. 2014) across the globe. The correlation between warm incubation temperatures and female-biased hatchling production has been widely reported in sea turtle populations (Janzen et al. 1994; Hawkes et al. 2007; Laloë et al. 2016), heightening concerns that climate warming may lead to the production of female-only populations and eventual extinction (Hays et al. 2014). Additionally, species determined by (TSD) such as sea turtles could also be potentially threatened by mortality of eggs and hatchlings due to high incubation temperatures (Bell et al. 2003; Santidrian Tomillo et al. 2012, 2014; Laloë et al. 2017).

Extremely warm incubation conditions (> 30 °C) were recorded in unshaded sites during the current study on the Caribbean coast of Costa Rica. These conditions are likely to produce a female-biased sex ratio, similar to results from other Caribbean sites during the past decades (Laloë et al. 2016). In contrast, the hatchling sex ratio emerging from shaded clutches is likely to be male-biased due to lower temperatures (< 28.5 °C), Longer incubation periods were recorded in shaded rather than unshaded conditions, which corroborate that lower incubation temperatures prolong the incubation period and embryonic development of sea turtle species (Van de Merwe et al. 2005; Hays, Mazaris and Schofield 2014; Laloe et al. 2014, 2016). Mean hatching success was significantly higher from shaded clutches supporting results from other studies of leatherback populations (Rivas et al. 2018; Patiño et al. 2012; Hill et al. 2015). This may be the result of lower incubation temperatures in shaded conditions and a consequent decrease in embryonic mortality linked to high temperatures

(Bell et al. 2004; Santidrian et al. 2012, 2014; Howard et al. 2014). Mortality is higher in warm incubation conditions (i.e. female-producing nests) so it is logical that there are sublethal effects of warm, female-producing temperatures (Hays et al. 2017).

Our findings revealed that at all depths, hatchlings emerging from cooler nests had improved fitness in terms of size, weight and locomotor performance. This is the first study to record phenotype and terrestrial performance for leatherback turtles, though they have been recorded for other species, for instance green turtles *Chelonia mydas* (Booth and Evans, 2011; Weber et al. 2012), loggerhead turtles *Caretta caretta* (Fisher et al. 2014; Sim et al. 2015) and olive ridley turtles *Lepidochelys olivacea* (Maulany et al. 2012). Considering that a negative correlation between incubation temperature and hatchling size (Hewavisenthi and Parmenter 2001; Ischer et al. 2009; Booth and Evans 2011; Read et al. 2012; Weber et al. 2012), and between incubation temperature and crawling speed have been documented in all sea turtle species (Chu et al. 2008; Ischer et al. 2009; Mickelson and Downie 2010; Maulany et al. 2012; Read et al. 2012; Booth et al. 2013; Fisher et al. 2014; Wood et al. 2014; Sim et al. 2015), the influence of incubation temperature on post-hatchling locomotion performance and growth are the traits that are likely to have the greatest effect on hatchling fitness (Burgess et al. 2006).

277 Leatherback turtles exhibit both polyandry and polygyny (Crim et al. 2002), therefore,
278 increased frequency of male breeding would help ameliorate female-biased hatchling sex, but
279 the effective population size in sea turtles is still unknown (Hays et al. 2010).

If the projections of increasing temperatures in the next decades are confirmed (IPCC 2013), the proportion of nests experiencing extremely high temperatures is likely to increase, which may affect hatchling survival rates. Based on incubation temperature assessment, this study showed that male hatchlings are likely to exhibit higher fitness than females, which could

provide higher survivorship of males than females; and consequently, might mitigate the female-skewed sex ratio production at most nesting populations around the world. Taking into account the skewed sex ratios towards males were mainly produced under shade treatment, it is recommended that new beach management strategies are considered to produce balanced sex ratios. Additionally, the highest mortality of deeper clutches by increasing water table levels highlighted that inundation episodes might affect all beach width (Rivas et al. 2018), including distant locations from high tide line. Considering, nests relocated at upper depths presented higher hatching success than the deepest ones, a hatchery might be an effective tool to mitigate the mortality of deep nests by water table rises and increase the reproductive output of sea turtle populations. However, we highly recommend leaving *in situ* nests, urge caution when relocating nests and assessing beach microhabitat conditions prior selecting hatchery locations and shading treatments by every sea turtle monitoring programme.

Acknowledgements

We thank John Denham and Director Carlos Fernandez for the management of PNR and their involvement in conservation projects. We also thank all coordinators, assistants, and volunteers who worked at PNR over the years for their full dedication to the experiments. Dr Manuel Spinola for analysis support. International mobility grant in Marta Abreu de las Villas University, Santa Clara, Cuba by (AUIP grant). International mobility grant for prestigious researchers by (CEIMAR) International Campus of Excellence of the Sea. Research permits were obtained from the Ministry of Environment and Energy (MINAE) of Costa Rica (R-SINAC-ACLAC-PIME-009-2013).

Author contributions

MLR and AM conceived and designed the experiments. MLR performed the experiments and analyzed the data. MLR wrote and AM and NE revised the manuscript.

Fig. 1. Hatching success (%) of leatherback clutches under sun and shade treatment and depth
(50, 75 and 90 cm) in 2013, 2014 and 2015. The centre point in the box represents the mean
value; the whiskers represent 95% confidence interval.

Fig. 2. Straight Carapace Length (SCL) (mm), Straight Carapace Width (SCW) (mm) and
weight (g) of leatherback hatchlings under sun and shade treatment and depth (50, 75 and 90
cm) in 2013, 2014 and 2015. The horizontal line in the box represents the mean value; the
whiskers represent 95% confidence interval. Grey points represent individual measurements
and black points outliers.

Fig. 3. A. Straight Carapace Length (SCL) (mm), B. Straight Carapace Width (SCW) (mm)
and C. Weight (g) of leatherback hatchlings under sun and shade treatments in 2013-2015.
The horizontal line in the box represents the mean value; the whiskers represent 95%
confidence interval.

Fig. 4. Body temperature (°C) of leatherback hatchlings under sun and shade treatment and
depth (50, 75 and 90 cm) in 2013, 2014 and 2015. The horizontal line in the box represents
the mean value; the whiskers represent 95% confidence interval. Grey points represent
individual measurements.

Fig. 5. Righting response (min) of leatherback hatchlings under sun and shade treatment and
depth (50, 75 and 90 cm) in 2013-2015. The horizontal line in the box represents the mean
value; the whiskers represent 95% confidence interval. Grey points represent individual
measurements.

Fig. 6. Crawling time (min) of leatherback hatchlings under sun and shade treatment in 20132015. The horizontal line in the box represents the mean value; the whiskers represent 95%
confidence interval.





⁹ 335 **Fig 2.**





- 63 64 65



- $\begin{array}{c} 20\\ 21\\ 22\\ 23\\ 25\\ 26\\ 27\\ 28\\ 29\\ 30\\ 31\\ 32\\ 33\\ 35\\ 36\\ 37\\ 38\\ 39\\ 40\\ 41\\ 42\\ 43\\ \end{array}$





Table 1. Phenotype (Straight carapace length (SCL) (mm), Straight carapace width (SCW) (mm) and weight (g)), body temperature (°C) and locomotor variables (fitness index (g mm -1), righting response (s) and crawling time (min)) of hatchlings under sun and shade treatment and depth (50, 75 and 90 cm) in 2013, 2014 and 2015.

| | Shade | | | | | |
|------------------------|------------|------|-------|-----|-------|--------|
| Variables | treatments | Mean | SD | Ν | F | р |
| SCL (mm) | Sun | 59.1 | 1.99 | 50 | 236.6 | < 0.01 |
| | Shade | 61.0 | 1.33 | 44 | | |
| SCW (mm) | Sun | 41.1 | 2.94 | 50 | 122.5 | < 0.01 |
| | Shade | 41.6 | 1.01 | 44 | | |
| Weight (g) | Sun | 47.6 | 6.77 | 50 | 52.8 | < 0.01 |
| | Shade | 50.3 | 5.76 | 44 | | |
| Body Temperature (° C) | Sun | 27.9 | 3.49 | 49 | 1.47 | 0.14 |
| | Shade | 27.3 | 2.91 | 43 | | |
| Index of physical | Sun | | | | | |
| condition (g mm -1) | Sull | 0.80 | 0.11 | 50 | 0.95 | 0.34 |
| | Shade | 0.83 | 0.10 | 44 | | |
| Righting response (s) | Sun | 64.0 | 34.20 | 28 | 6.0 | < 0.01 |
| | Shade | 42.7 | 29.78 | 21 | | |
| Crawling time (min) | Sun | 7.2 | 4.68 | 181 | 16.87 | < 0.01 |
| | Shade | 5.9 | 3.91 | 152 | | |
| | | | | | | |

References

Bell BA, Spotila JR, Paladino FV, Reina RD (2004) Low reproductive success of leatherbackturtles, Dermochelys coriacea, is due to high embryonic mortality. Biological Conservation 115:131–138. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-3207(03)00102-2</u>

Booth DT, Feeney R, Shibata Y (2013) Nest and maternal origin can influence morphology and locomotor performance of hatchling green turtles (Chelonia mydas) incubated in field nests. Marine Biology 160:127-137. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-012-2070-y</u>

Booth DT and Evans A (2011) Warm water and cool nests are best. How global warming might influence hatchling green turtle swimming performance. PLoS ONE 6. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0023162

Burgess EA, Booth DT, Lanyon JM (2006) Swimming performance of hatchling green turtles is affected by incubation temperature. Coral Reefs 25:341–349. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-006-0116-7

Chevalier J, Godfrey MH, Girondot M (1999) Significant difference of temperaturedependent sex determination between French Guiana (Atlantic) and Playa Grande (Costa-Rica, Pacific) leatherbacks (Dermochelys coriacea). Annales des Sciences Naturelles - Zoologie et Biologie Animale 20:147–152. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0003-4339(00)88882-6</u>

Crim JL, Spotila LD, Spotila JR, O'Connor M, Reina R, Williams CJ, Paladino FV (2002) The leatherback turtle, Dermochelys coriacea, exhibits both polyandry and polygyny. Molecular Ecology 11:2097–2106. <u>https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-294X.2002.01591.x</u>

Delmas V, Baudry E, Girondot M, Prevot-Julliard AC (2007) The righting response as a fitness index in freshwater turtles. Biological Journal of the Linnean Society 91:99–109. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8312.2007.00780.x

Dutton DL, Dutton PH, Chaloupka M, Boulon RH (2005) Increase of a Caribbean leatherback turtle Dermochelys coriacea nesting population linked to long-term nest protection. Biological Conservation 126:186–194. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2005.05.013

Esteban N, Laloë J-O, Mortimer JA, Guzman AN, Hays GC (2016) Male hatchling production in sea turtles from one of the world's largest marine protected areas, the Chagos Archipelago. Scientific Reports 6:20339. doi:10.1038/srep20339

Fernandez-Chacón A, Bertolero A, Amengual A, Tavecchia G, Homar V, Oro D (2011) Spatial heterogeneity in the effects of climate change on the population dynamics of a Mediterranean tortoise. Global Change Biology 17:3075–3088. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02469.x

Fisher LR, Godfrey MH, Owens DW (2014) Incubation temperature effects on hatchling performance in the loggerhead sea turtle (Caretta caretta). PLoS ONE 9:e114880. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0114880</u>

Fuentes MMPB, Maynard JA, Guinea M, Bell IP, Werdell PJ, Hamann M (2009) Proxy indicators of sand temperature help project impacts of global warming on sea turtles in northern Australia. Endangered Species Research 9:33–40. http://dx.doi.org/10.3354/esr00224

Garrett K, Wallace BP, Garner J, Paladino FV (2010) Variations in leatherback turtle nest environments: Consequences for hatching success. Endangered Species Research 11:147–155. https://doi.org/10.3354/esr00273

Girondot M, Godfrey MH, Ponge L, Rivalan P (2007) Modeling Approaches to Quantify Leatherback Nesting Trends in French Guiana and Suriname. Chelonian Conservation and Biology 6:37–46. <u>https://doi.org/10.2744/1071-8443</u>

Girondot M, Monsinjon J, Guillon J-M (2018) Delimitation of the embryonic thermosensitive period for sex determination using an embryo growth model reveals a potential bias for sex ratio prediction in turtles. Journal of Thermal Biology. 73:32-42. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtherbio.2018.02.006

Glen F, Broderick AC, Godley BJ, Hays GC (2003) Incubation environment affects the phenotype of naturally incubated green turtle hatchlings. Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the UK, 83.

Godfrey MH, Barreto R, Mrosovsky N (1996) Estimating past and present sex ratios of sea turtles in Suriname. Canadian Journal of Zoology 74:267–277. <u>https://doi.org/10.1139/z96-033</u>

Grayson KL, Mitchell NJ, Monks JM, Keall SN, Wilson JN, et al. (2014) Sex Ratio Bias and Extinction Risk in an Isolated Population of Tuatara (Sphenodon punctatus). PLoS ONE 9: e94214. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0094214</u>

Hawkes LA, Broderick AC, Godfrey MH, Godley BJ (2009) Climate change and marine turtles. Endangered Species Research 7:137–154. https://doi.org/10.3354/esr00198

Hawkes LA, Broderick AC, Godfrey MH, Godley BJ (2007) Investigating the potential impacts of climate change on marine turtle population. Global Change Biology 13: 923–932. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2007.01320.x</u>

Hays GC, Fossette S, Katselidis KA, Schofield G, Gravenor MB (2010) Breeding periodicity for male seaturtles, operational sex ratios, and implications in the face of climate change. *Conservation Biology*, 24:1636–1643. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1523-1739.2010.01531.x

Hays GC, Mazaris AD, Schofield G (2014) Different male vs. female breeding periodicity helps mitigate offspring sex ratio skews in sea turtles. Frontiers in Marine Science 1:1–9. <u>https://doi.org/10.3389/fmars.2014.00043</u>

Hays GC, Mazaris AD, Schofield G, Laloë JO (2017) Population viability at extreme sex-ratio skews produced by temperature-dependent sex determination. Proc. R. Soc. B 284: 20162576. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2016.2576

Hewavisenthi S and Parmenter CJ (2001) Influence of incubation environment on the development of the Flatback turtle (Natator depressus). Copeia 2001:668–682. https://doi.org/10.1643/0045-8511

Houghton JDR, Myers AE, Lloyd C, King RS, Isaacs C, Hays GC (2007) Protracted rainfall decreases temperature within leatherback turtle (Dermochelys coriacea) clutches in Grenada, West Indies: Ecological implications for a species displaying temperature dependent sex determination. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 345:71–77. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2007.02.001</u>

Hill JE, Paladino FV, Spotila JR, Tomillo PS (2015) Shading and watering as a tool to mitigate the impacts of climate change in sea turtle nests. PloS one 10: e0129528

Howard R, Bell I, Pike DA (2014) Thermal tolerances of sea turtle embryos: Current understanding and future directions. Endangered Species Research 26:75–86. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0129528

Hulin V, Delmas V, Girondot M, Godfrey M, Guillon JM (2009) Temperaturedependent sex determination and global change: are some species at greater risk? Oecologia 160:493–506. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-009-1313-1</u>

Hurrell JW, Kushnir Y, Otterson G, Visbeck M (2003) An Overview of the North Atlantic Oscillation. The North Atlantic Oscillation: Climatic Significance and Environmental Impact 134, 263. <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/134GM01</u>

IPCC (2013) Climate Change 2013. The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (eds Stocker TF, Qin D, Plattner GK et al) Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Ischer T, Ireland K, Booth DT (2009) Locomotion performance of green turtle hatchlings from the Heron Island Rookery, Great Barrier Reef. Marine Biology 156:1399–1409. doi: 10.1007/s00227-009-1180-7

Janzen FJ, Tucker JK, Paukstis GL (2000) Experimental Analysis of an Early Life-History Stage: Selection on body Size of Hatchling Turtles?. Functional ecology 81:2290–2304. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2435.2006.01220.x</u>

Janzen FJ (1994) Climate change and temperature-dependent sex determination in reptiles. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 91:7487–7490. <u>https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.91.16.7487</u>

Jourdan J and Fuentes MMPB (2015) Effectiveness of strategies at reducing sand temperature to mitigate potential impacts from changes in environmental temperature on sea turtle reproductive output. Mitigation and Adaptation Strategies for Global Change, 20, 121–133. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s11027-013-9482-y</u>

Kraemer JE and Bell R (1980) Rain-Induced Mortality of Eggs and Hatchlings of Loggerhead Sea Turtles (Caretta caretta) on the Georgia Coast. Herpetologica 36:72–77. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/3891858</u>

Laloë J-O, Cozens J, Renom B, Taxonera A, Hays GC (2017) Climate change and temperature-linked hatchling mortality at a globally important sea turtle nesting site. Global Change Biology 23:1-10. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13765</u>

Laloë J-O, Esteban N, Berkel J, Hays GC (2016) Sand temperatures for nesting sea turtles in the Caribbean: Implications for hatchling sex ratios in the face of climate change. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 474:92-99. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2015.09.015

Laloë J-O, Cozens J, Renom B, Taxonera A, Hays GC (2014) Effects of rising temperature on the viability of an important sea turtle rookery. Nature climate change 4:513–518. <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate2236</u>

Matsuzawa Y, Sato K, Sakamoto W, Bjorndal KA (2002) Seasonal fluctuations in sand temperature: effects on the incubation period and mortality of log- gerhead sea turtle (Caretta caretta) pre-emergent hat- chlings in Minabe, Japan. Marine Biology 140:639-646. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-001-0724-2</u>

Maulany RI, Booth DT, Baxter GS (2012) The effect of incubation temperature on hatchling quality in the olive ridley turtle, Lepidochelys olivacea, from Alas Purwo National Park, East Java, Indonesia: Implications for hatchery management. Marine Biology 159:2651–2661. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-012-2022-6</u>

Mcgehee MA (1990) Effects of moisture on eggs and hatchlings of loggerhead sea turtles (Caretta caretta). Herpetologica 46:251–258. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3892967

Mickelson LE and Downie JR (2010) Influence of incubation temperature on morphology and locomotion performance of Leatherback (Dermochelys coriacea) hatchlings. Canadian Journal of Zoology 88:359–368. <u>https://doi.org/10.1139/Z10-007</u>

Miller JD (1999) Determining clutch size and hatching success. In K. L. Eckert, K. A. Bjorndal, F. A. Abreu-Grobois and M. Donnelly (Eds.), Research and management techniques for the conservation of sea turtles (pp. 124– 129). Washington, DC: IUCN/SSC Marine Turtle Specialist Group Publication.

Mitchel, NJ, Allendorf FW, Keall SN, Daugherty CH, Nelson NJ (2010) Demographic effects of temperature-dependent sex determination: Will tuatara survive global warming? Global Change Biology 16:60–72. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.01964.x</u>

Mrosovsky N and Pieau C (1991) Transitional range of temperature, pivotal temperatures and thermosensitive stages for sex determination in reptiles. Amphibia-Reptilia 12:169–179. https://doi.org/10.1163/156853891X00149

Neuwald JL, and Valenzuela N (2011). The lesser known challenge of climate change: thermal variance and sex-reversal in vertebrates with temperature-dependent sex determination. PLoS One_6: e18117. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0018117</u>

Ospina-Alvarez N and Piferrer F (2008) Temperature-dependent sex determination in fish revisited: prevalence, a single sex ratio response pattern, and possible effects of climate change. PLoS One 3:e2837. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0002837</u>

Ottersen G, Planque B, Belgrano A, Post E, Reid PC, Stenseth NC. (2001) Ecological effects of the North Atlantic Oscillation. Oecologia, 128, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1007/s004420100655

Patino-Martinez J, Marco A, Quiñones L, Hawkes LA (2014) The potential future influence of sea level rise on leatherback turtle nests. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology, 461, 116–123. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2014.07.021</u>

Patiño-Martínez J, Marco A, Quiñones L, Hawkes L (2012) A potential tool to mitigate the impacts of climate change to the Caribbean Leatherback Sea Turtle. Global Change Biology 18:401-411. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02532.x</u>

Pike DA, Roznik EA, Bell I (2015) Nest inundation from sea-level rise threatens sea turtle population viability Subject Category: Subject Areas: Author for correspondence: Royal Society Open Science, 2, 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsos.150127

Pike DA (2014) Forecasting the viability of sea turtle eggs in a warming world. Global Change Biology 20:7–15. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12397

Pike DA (2013) Climate influences the global distribution of sea turtle nesting. Global Ecology and Biogeography 22:555–566. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12025</u>

Pike DA (2013) Forecasting range expansion into ecological traps: Climate-mediated shifts in sea turtle nesting beaches and human development. Global Change Biology 19:3082–3092. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12282</u>

Read T, Booth DT, Limpus CJ (2012) Effect of nest temperature on hatchling phenotype of loggerhead turtles (Caretta caretta) from two South Pacific rookeries, Mon Repos and la Roche Percée. Australian Journal of Zoology 60:402–411. https://doi.org/10.1071/ZO12079

Rimblot F, Fretey J, Mrosovsky N, Lescure J, Pieau C (1985) Sexual differentiation as a function of the incubation temperature of eggs in the sea-turtle Dermochelys coriacea (Vandelli, 1761). Amphib-Reptilia 6: 83–92. https://doi.org/10.1163/156853885X00218

Rivas ML, Spínola M, Arrieta H and Faife- Cabrera M (2018) Effect of extreme climatic events resulting in prolonged precipitation on the reproductive output of sea turtles. Animal Conservation. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/acv.12404</u>

Rivas ML, Santidrian P, Diéguez-Uribeondo J, Marco A (2016a) Potential effects of dune scarps caused by beach erosion on the nesting behaviour of leatherback turtles. Marine Ecology Progress Series, 551, 239–248. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps11748

Rivas ML and Marco A (2016b) The effect of dune vegetation on leatherback hatchling's sea-finding ability. El efecto de la vegetación de dunas en la capacidad de

orientación hacia el mar de las crías de la tortuga baula. *Marine Biology* 163:13. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00227-015-2796-4</u>

Rivas ML, Fernández C, Marco A (2016c) Nesting ecology and population trend of leatherback turtles Dermochelys coriacea at Pacuare Nature Reserve, Costa Rica. Oryx 50: 274–282. <u>https://doi.org/10.1017/S0030605314000775</u>.

Saba VS, Stock CA, Spotila JR, Paladino FV, Tomillo PS (2012) Projected response of an endangered marine turtle population to climate change. Nature Climate Change 2:814–820. <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1582</u>

Santidrián Tomillo P, Fonseca L, Paladino FV, Spotila JR, Oro D (2017) Are thermal barriers "higher" in deep sea turtle nests? PLoS ONE 12:1–14. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0177256

Santidrián Tomillo P, Genovart M, Paladino FV, Spotila JR, Oro D (2015) Climate change overruns resilience conferred by temperature-dependent sex determination in sea turtles and threatens their survival. Global Change Biology 21:2980–2988. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12918

Santidrián Tomillo P, Saba VS, Blanco GS, Stock CA, Paladino FV, Spotila JR (2012) Climate driven egg and hatchling mortality threatens survival of eastern Pacific leatherback turtles. PloS one 7:1–7. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0037602</u>

Santidrián Tomillo P, Saba VS, Lombard CD. et al (2015) Global analysis of the effect of local climate on the hatchling output of leatherback turtles. Scientific Reports 5:16789. <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/srep16789</u>

Sim EL, Booth DT, Limpus CJ (2015) Incubation temperature, morphology and performance in loggerhead (Caretta caretta) turtle hatchlings from Mon Repos, Queensland, Australia. Biology Open 4:685–692. <u>https://doi.org/10.1242/bio.20148995</u>

Standora EA and Spotila JR (1985) Temperature Dependent Sex Determination in Sea Turtles. Copeia 1985:711–722. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/1444765</u>

Stenseth NC, Ottersen G, Hurrell JW et al (2003) Review article. Studying climate effects on ecology through the use of climate indices: the North Atlantic Oscillation, El Nino Southern Oscillation and beyond. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 270:2087–2096. <u>https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2003.2415</u>

Stewart K, Sims M, Meylan A, Witherington B, Brost B, Crowder LB (2011) Leatherback nests increasing significantly in Florida, USA; Trends assessed over 30 years using multilevel modeling. Ecological Applications 21:263–273. https://doi.org/10.1890/09-1838.1

Steyermark AC and Spotila JR (2001) Body temperature and maternal identity affect snapping turtle (Chelydra serpentina) righting response. Copeia 4:1050–1057. https://doi.org/10.1643/0045-8511

Strüssmann CA, Conover DO, Somoza GM, Miranda LA (2010) Implications of climate change for the reproductive capacity and survival of New World silversides

(family Atherinopsidae). Journal of Fish Biology 77:1818–1834. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8649.2010.02780.x

Van Houtan KS and Bass OL (2007) Stormy oceans are associated with declines in sea turtle hatching. Current Biology 17:590–591. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2007.06.021</u>

Van de Merwe J, Ibrahim K, Whittier J (2005) Effects of hatchery shading and nest depth on the development and quality of Chelonia mydas hatchlings: implications for hatchery management in Peninsular, Malaysia. Australian Journal Zoology 53:205–211. https://doi.org/10.1071/ZO03052

Weber SB, Broderick AC, Groothuis TGG, Ellick J, Godley BJ, Blount JD (2012) Finescale thermal adaptation in a green turtle nesting population. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 279:1077–1084. <u>https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2011.1238</u>

Webster PJ, Holland GJ, Curry JA, Chang HR (2005) Changes in tropical cyclone number, duration, and intensity in a warming environment. Science 309:1844–1846. https://doi.org/1126/science.1116448

Wernberg T, Smale DA, Tuya F (2013) An extreme climatic event alters marine ecosystem structure in a global biodiversity hotspot. Nature Climate Change 3:78-82. https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate1627

Wood A, Booth DT, Limpus CJ (2014) Sun exposure, nest temperature and loggerhead turtle hatchlings: Implications for beach shading management strategies at sea turtle rookeries. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 451:105–114. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2013.11.005

Woolgar L, Trocini S, Mitchell N (2013) Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology Key parameters describing temperature-dependent sex determination in the southernmost population of loggerhead sea turtles. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 449:77–84. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2013.09.001</u>

Yntema C and Mrosovsky N (1980) Sexual differentiation in hatchling loggerheads (Caretta caretta) incubated at different controlled temperatures. Herpetologica 36:33–36. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/3891850</u>