



Swansea University  
Prifysgol Abertawe



## Cronfa - Swansea University Open Access Repository

---

This is an author produced version of a paper published in:  
*Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*

Cronfa URL for this paper:  
<http://cronfa.swan.ac.uk/Record/cronfa38534>

---

### **Paper:**

Bermingham, N. & Higham, G. (2018). Immigrants as new speakers in Galicia and Wales: issues of integration, belonging and legitimacy. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 1-13.  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2018.1429454>

---

This item is brought to you by Swansea University. Any person downloading material is agreeing to abide by the terms of the repository licence. Copies of full text items may be used or reproduced in any format or medium, without prior permission for personal research or study, educational or non-commercial purposes only. The copyright for any work remains with the original author unless otherwise specified. The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holder.

Permission for multiple reproductions should be obtained from the original author.

Authors are personally responsible for adhering to copyright and publisher restrictions when uploading content to the repository.

<http://www.swansea.ac.uk/library/researchsupport/ris-support/>

## **Immigrants as new speakers: Issues of integration, belonging and legitimacy**

Nicola Bermingham<sup>a</sup> and Gwennan Higham<sup>b</sup>

*<sup>a</sup>Department of Languages and Intercultural Studies, Heriot-Watt University;*

*<sup>b</sup>Department of Welsh, Swansea University*

n.bermingham@hw.ac.uk, g.e.higham@swansea.ac.uk

## **Immigrants as new speakers in Galicia and Wales: issues of integration, belonging and legitimacy**

### **Abstract**

Immigrant integration in nation states increasingly focuses on the importance of learning the national state language. This is evidenced by increased emphasis on rigorous language testing and tighter citizenship regulations. This paper analyses immigrant integration in two sub-state contexts, Galicia and Wales, where presence of a national language as well as a local language reveal different linguistic complexities and realities which concern the new speaker. How do immigrants respond to bilingual host community settings? To what extent are new speakers able to claim ownership on more than one host community language? Are new immigrant speakers of Galician and Welsh considered 'legitimate' speakers of these languages? To answer these questions, this paper will compare and contrast results from two ethnographically-based research projects, showing that immigrants in both these contexts are challenging traditional concepts of new speakers of minority languages, opening up new ways of belonging but also revealing boundaries to their pathways of becoming legitimate new speakers.

**Keywords: immigrant integration, legitimacy, new speakers, Galician, Welsh**

## **Introduction**

In an era of accelerating globalisation, changing migration patterns and increased political devolution, questions of language and belonging are being challenged, in minority language as well as in majority language contexts. In light of this, this paper examines two different sociolinguistic contexts: Galicia and Wales. Despite demographic differences, both languages share preoccupations over their vitality and both have experienced fairly recent attempts least at policy level to move away from an ethnolinguistic agenda towards a civic inclusive model of citizenship and language. In both contexts, immigrants are increasingly becoming ‘new speakers’ or rather ‘double new speakers’—learning the state language (Spanish in Spain and English in Wales) as well as the local language (Galician or Welsh). In this paper, we will focus on ‘immigrant new speakers’ of minority languages. By drawing on interview data from separate case studies carried out in Galicia and Wales, we explore immigrants’ relationship to their new language and look at the opportunities and challenges encountered by immigrants when learning a minority and majority language in a new host community. We examine how although minority and local languages are awarded increasing linguistic capital on certain linguistic markets (Bourdieu 1991; Heller 2011), tensions around legitimacy and ethnicity remain (O’Rourke and Ramallo 2013; O’Rourke 2011). While the studies were not initially intended to be presented comparatively, commonalities between both data sets are seen notably in the transformations and maintenance of ethnolinguistic frontiers. Comparing the effects of increased immigration on national language minorities renders this comparison not only possible, but pertinent.

## **New speakers in Galicia and Wales**

Galicia is one of Spain's autonomous communities, located in the north west of the Iberian Peninsula. It is one of three autonomous communities, along with Catalonia and the Basque Country, which has a recognised, co-official minority language (Galician). In 2013, 57 per cent of Galicians aged 5 or over claimed to be able speak Galician very well, 30 per cent claimed to speak it fairly well, and 13 per cent claimed to speak it a little bit or not at all (Instituto Galego de Estatística 2013). Moreover, in 2013, 31 per cent of Galician people said they always speak Galician in their day-to-day lives. During the latter part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the Galician autonomous government ('Xunta' in Galician) worked towards promoting the Galician language, increasing its visibility by making it the language of local government and establishing it as a compulsory subject in primary and secondary education. These measures greatly increased the Galician literacy levels of the population and awarded prestige to the language, something it had lost during the Franco dictatorship due to the restrictions on its use. Due to its geographic isolation and relatively high unemployment levels, however, Galicia has not sustained the same level of immigration as other autonomous communities such as Madrid or Barcelona. Nevertheless, since the turn of the century, migratory flows have begun to shift, with ever more numbers of migrants settling in Galicia (Silva Domínguez and Recalde 2012; see also O'Rourke, present volume).

Wales is one of the four devolved nations of the United Kingdom. Its original language, Welsh, is co-official alongside English in Wales. Although historically the main language within its borders, it became an increasingly minoritised language throughout the late 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Century. Despite still being the majority language in

some areas of Wales<sup>1</sup> as well as increased language revitalisation measures, Welsh is subject to continuous inward and outward migration affecting the vitality of Welsh speaking communities. With a population of around 3 million, the 2011 Census states that 562,000 are able to speak Welsh, which totals less than 20 per cent of the Welsh population. The small decline in the number of Welsh speakers between the 2001 and the 2011 Census has been largely attributed to increased levels of migration from within and outside the UK, suggesting that integrating incomers through the Welsh language is a key step for the future vitality of the language (see also Hornsby and Vigers, present volume).

Despite initiatives from sub-state governments to promote learning of the local language in Galicia and Wales, immigrants still face obstacles concerning the new language or languages of their host communities. In this respect, Galicia and Wales can be compared in terms of issues and challenges and in terms of discourse on endangerment and the need to attract ‘new speakers’ (Frias-Conde 2006; O’Rourke and Ramallo 2013). Nevertheless, a new group of double new speakers, who are learning both languages historically present in their host communities are emerging.

In the Galician context, the term *neofalante* refers to new speakers of Galician (O’Rourke and Ramallo 2010; see also O’Rourke, present volume). In the Welsh context, until recently (Robert 2009), research on new speakers has focused on the differences between Welsh traditional speakers and Welsh learners as opposed to new speakers who have become active users of the language. These learners are, for the most part, British born people who already speak English and have taken an active interest in the Welsh language.

---

<sup>1</sup> North West county of Gwynedd has the highest percentage of Welsh speakers which is estimated at around 70 per cent of the population (Welsh Language Commissioner 2016).

## **Language revitalisation: From minority language maintenance towards civic models of inclusion**

The latter half of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century saw a rise in claims over minority rights within a wider movement of liberal democracy in the West. National language groups, such as those found in Galicia and Wales were mobilised in the effort to affirm and have recognised their minoritised languages and move out of what can be understood as an essentially colonial relationship with the dominant language and speakers of that dominant language. In both contexts, efforts in the second half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century were aimed at ensuring the vitality and promotion of the local language.

In Spain, as the country transitioned to democracy and experienced new migratory flows, the bilingual autonomous regions of Galicia, Catalonia and the Basque Country began to re-examine their existing language policies (Hoffmann 2000). Similarly, the Welsh context saw successful campaigns for bilingual signage and a Welsh television channel and latterly the establishment of the Welsh Government with devolved powers in areas such as education and the Welsh language (Higham 2014). Both contexts compared have devolved language policies, which are accompanied by compulsory teaching of Galician and Welsh for children as well as increased opportunities for adults to learn the local language.

One of the most significant steps in 21<sup>st</sup> Century Galician language planning has been the enactment of the *Plan xeral de normalización da lingua galega* (General Plan for the Linguistic Normalisation of the Galician Language), approved by the Galician parliament in 2004. While the plan focuses on issues relating to linguistic rights, education and technology, it also notes the importance of equipping the

immigrant community with Galician language skills. The plan lists one of its objectives as the following:

To include the immigrant population in the language of Galicia, guaranteeing them the opportunity to access interesting, free and quality education (Xunta de Galicia 2004, 45, authors' translation).

The Welsh Language Measure (2011), which established the role of the Welsh Language Commissioner, also requires that Welsh should not be regarded less favourably than English. *Iaith Pawb*, an ambitious action plan for a bilingual Wales, further states the Government's commitment to make Welsh accessible to all its citizens. Furthermore, in the Welsh Government's 'welcome pack' for migrants, it states that acquisition of both host community languages is encouraged:

Wales is an inclusive, multicultural and multi-faith country and we welcome the diversity of migrants [...] Wales has a language of its own, that we are rightly proud of. We would certainly encourage you to learn Welsh, as well as English (Welsh Government 2012, 4).

Moreover, devolved areas such as community cohesion pave the way to distinct local policies on integration, which give value to teaching Welsh and English as well as valuing home languages in the education system:

Learning English/Welsh in addition to a different home language should be valued, included and appropriately challenged, as well as provided with opportunities where possible to maintain, and gain accreditation in, their home language (Welsh Government 2010, 26).



Education thus opens up a key avenue in the recruitment of new speakers of Galician and Welsh, which increasingly includes non-native speakers of Spanish in the Galician context and non-native speakers of English in the Welsh context. Although changes from without come as a result of globalisation and the mobility of populations, Lamarre (2013) points out that the linguistic frontiers which underpin linguistic nationalism are being challenged from within by the immigrant new speaker.

It can be argued that efforts at language revitalisation in both cases have been successful in promoting and increasing educational opportunities in the local language. Although post-dictatorship language policy in Galicia has received criticism (del Valle 2000; Lorenzo Suárez 2008; O'Rourke, present volume), the status of Galician has improved since the turn of the century. Galician is now not merely seen as a language that is suitable exclusively for informal domains, and written use of the language has increased (Monteagudo 2004). In Wales, bilingual education has become legitimised and non-Welsh speakers increasingly send their children to Welsh-medium institutions, opening up a key avenue in the recruitment of new Welsh speakers (Thomas and Williams 2013).

Despite successes in recruiting new speakers of Galician and Welsh in recent years, both cases display the multi-faceted challenges of minority language revitalisation within nation state public discourses on identity and nationalism. Traditionally, theorists have categorised minority language such as Galician and Welsh as ethnic languages related to exclusion and ethnocentrism (Barry 2002; C. Williams 2004; Mill 2007). State languages such as Spanish and English have thus been categorised as civic, inclusive and tolerant languages for democratic nations and,

as a consequence, have been promoted as more inclusive for newcomers (Muro and Quiroga 2005; Higham 2014). In both research contexts, local (devolved) governments to some degree have worked towards promoting an increasingly civic model of nationalism and integration. With respect to the local languages of each community, local governments have made efforts to portray languages as ‘equally available’ to all, through the establishment of a range of language learning resources for adults and children alike. In Galicia, the *Plan galego de cidadanía, convivencia e integración* (Galician Plan for Citizenship, Coexistence and Integration), approved by the Galician Parliament in 2008, outlines measures for the “social integration” of the immigrant community, many of which focus on providing extra learning resources for immigrants who do not speak the languages of the region. Similarly, in the Welsh context, devolution since 1999 has brought with it a political vision for an inclusive and civic Wales. Policies on cohesion and inclusion in Wales such as *Getting on Together: a community cohesion strategy for Wales* (Welsh Government 2009) states the government’s intention to include immigrants into both language communities of Wales.

However, the rhetoric of local government policy is not always shown to be implemented in practice in both contexts. Criticisms of educational measures that promote inclusivity in the Galician context have highlighted the Hispanocentric aspect of language teaching, which denies legitimacy to varieties of Spanish other than standard peninsular Spanish (Silva Domínguez and Recalde 2012). Furthermore, evaluations of immigrant students are often approached from an ethnocentric perspective, with little support for languages of origin of immigrants and most support classes for students being based on models of segregation (Silva Domínguez and Recalde 2012). In Wales, claims concerning the transformation from ethnic to civic

nationalism have brought with it doubts regarding the inclusivity of the Welsh language (Brooks 2009). Much academic writing in Wales portrays the Welsh-speaking community as ethnocentric in its treatment towards ethnic minorities in Wales, thus questioning its role in a civic, open and multicultural nation-building project (for instance C. Williams 2004; Brooks 2009; D. G. Williams 2015). Despite shifts from multicultural to intercultural views on diversity as well as the UK government's tightening on English language requirements for national citizenship, there is no strategy or support for integrating immigrants through the Welsh language.

Nevertheless, with international immigration to Galicia and Wales on the increase, a redefinition of language, identity and community is underway, forcing these traditionally bilingual societies to deal with newer plurilingual realities in and outside the classroom (Silva Domínguez and Recalde 2012).

### **Comparative analysis of both studies**

The discussion which follows is based on two separate case studies carried out by the authors in Galicia and Wales. Although both studies draw on local language and integration policies, for the purpose of this paper, we will draw largely upon interview data with immigrants, revealing the voices of immigrant new speakers of Galician and Welsh concerning language learning and integration in local contexts.<sup>2</sup> The interviews for both these studies were carried out in either Galician or Spanish, or Welsh or English. The decision about the language in which to conduct the interview was left to each participant.

---

<sup>2</sup> Please note that longer extracts from the interviews selected for this article are available in the respective authors' PhD theses.

The study carried out in Galicia focused on teachers and Cape Verdean students in two secondary schools in a fishing town called As Rocas.<sup>3</sup> The research questions centred on the language practices and language ideologies of immigrant students and teachers. Furthermore, the role that the education system plays in shaping these practices and ideologies was examined. 26 semi-structured life history interviews were carried out. These focused on the linguistic trajectories of immigrant students, probing issues about language choices, sense of identity, and experiences in the school system. The interviews were complemented with non-participant observation (i.e. without Bermingham taking an active part) in classroom settings and with ethnographic field notes.

The study carried out in Wales addressed adult immigrant ideologies to Welsh language learning. Participant observation was conducted by Higham as a teacher of Welsh language classes for adult immigrants in conjunction with or following English (ESOL) classes. Participants were all immigrants from outside the UK who had neither Welsh nor English as a home language. 25 semi-structured ‘life history’ interviews were thus carried out with the individuals, focusing on their linguistic trajectories. Further semi-structured interviews and focus groups were carried out with ESOL and Welsh for Adult teachers as well as Welsh Government officials. While some research has been done on the language socialisation of new speakers from within the UK (Mac Giolla Chríost et al 2012), this study’s aims were to analyse how adult learners from diverse immigrant backgrounds appropriate the minority language on their journey to becoming new speakers and ‘new citizens’, and how members of the host communities respond in turn.

---

<sup>3</sup> A pseudonym has been used to ensure anonymity.

### *Socio-economic advantages of language learning*

While many in the Galician and Welsh contexts have traditionally turned to their local languages for personal reasons such as family and as a resistance to globalisation (Iglesias Álvarez and Ramallo 2002; Gruffudd and Morris 2012), our studies show that new speakers from immigrant backgrounds are increasingly aware of the socio-economic advantages of learning minority languages. For example, in Galicia it is an essential requirement to have knowledge of Galician in order to gain employment in the civil service. The three extracts from the interview data below reflect the opinions of many participants in both contexts, who consider the minority language to be an opportunity which could enhance job prospects. Moreover, they highlight how not having knowledge of the minority language can at times be a hindrance when seeking employment in their bilingual communities.

#### *Example 1*

B: a ver eu meu fillo se me teño que quedar cun idioma quédase co castelán porque lle abarca máis [...] hoxe quedaríase co inglés porque lle abarca máis [...] se vamos ser prácticos aquí vamos falar do sentimental sentimental ou do práctico [...] a nivel práctico váleche máis o inglés có galego [...] eso comprendelo non? [...] ou incluso o alemán [...] ou francés [...] pero bueno // se non sabes galego en Galicia tamén vas mal porque xa non podes ter a administra a a os nosos traballos xa non podías e: ter opción ningunha a eles.

B: my son, if he had to just have one language it would be Spanish, because it offers him more [...] nowadays it would even be English because that has a wider span [...] if we're going to be practical here, we can talk about

sentimental reasons or practical ones [...] on a practical level English is worth more to you than Galician [...] you understand that, right? [...] or even German [...] or French [...] but, then again, if you don't know how to speak Galician in Galicia you're stuck because you can't access administrative jobs, you wouldn't be able to apply for any of them (Galician teacher, As Rocas).

*Example 2*

Mae cyfleoedd swydd yn llawer gwell—dylai fod mwy o bwysau oddi wrth y Llywodraeth.

Job opportunities are much better—there should be more pressure from the Government (Welsh language student, Gwynedd).

*Example 3*

Yn ail, ro'n i'n meddwl bod e'n dda ar fy CV am fy ngyrfa yn y dyfodol.

Secondly, I thought it would be good for my CV and for my career in the future (Welsh language student, Cardiff).

Minority language learning has been traditionally connected with reasons such as heritage and identity. Interestingly, the case of immigrant new speakers of minority languages appears to show a change in the motivations of new speakers. With increasing demand for job positions that require these languages as both desirable and key access to employment skills, the languages are increasingly viewed as being an investment (Peirce 1995) and as a valuable resource in local linguistic markets (Bourdieu 1982).

Duchêne and Heller (2012) highlight how discourses about the way in which languages are valued are shifting: although languages are still awarded value due to

their perceived links to cultural heritage and identity, discussions about the added value and economic advantages attributed to language learning are gaining prominence in public discourses. In order to explain the contrasting value frameworks attributed to languages, Duchêne and Heller propose the terms 'pride' and 'profit'. The metaphor of pride is used to refer to the cultural value attributed to languages. As discussed previously, in minority language contexts, the link between minority languages, cultural heritage and ethnic identity falls at the pride end of the value spectrum. The value system of pride is based on discourses of 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> Century German romanticism, an ideology which has been dominant in modern nation states for many decades and the foundations on which many minority rights movements have based their discourses. Nevertheless, Duchêne and Heller (2011) argue that late capitalism and the neoliberal economy provoked a shift in the way that linguistic resources are valued. They use the term profit as an opposite to the pride metaphor, where linguistic resources are valued because of the economic opportunities and benefits that are attributed to them.

Although minority languages such as Galician and Welsh were (and are still) awarded value because of their links to local culture and ethnic identity, our studies therefore show that there is a shift towards a profit-based framework. As a result of globalisation and migration, coupled with increased revitalisation movements and local language policies, migrants want to learn languages because of the possible employment opportunities. This profit framework is nevertheless not being experienced exclusively by the immigrant community. The elaboration of standard varieties of these two languages and their incorporation into official domains have increased the economic capital associated with learning of the languages: locals, too, recognise the opportunities that learning Galician or Welsh can provide. This profit

framework therefore may also be reflected in the transformations of ethnolinguistic frontiers, opening up new possible ways of belonging.

Although immigrants and locals alike discussed the possible job opportunities that learning a minority language could offer, there was also a sense that, if immigrants did not learn these languages, they would face exclusion from potential job sectors. This raises questions about how language can act as a tool for exclusion as well as inclusion.

### ***Plural ways of belonging***

Heller (2007) points out that globalisation and modernity are redefining how we perceive the relationship between language, community and nation. Ongoing transformations further challenge traditional social structures and the notion of bounded communities and bounded languages. Lamarre (2013) further suggests that these external changes to society redefine how individuals perceive their linguistic resources in relation to linguistic market “allowing for the possibility of using what is owned beyond the constraints of the local context, and calling for a more nuanced understanding of language as a form of capital” (Lamarre and Dagenais 2004). Our studies show how learning an additional language for immigrants was not an obstacle but rather a natural progression of their integration to their new home. While all spoke of the instrumental value of learning Spanish or English, many interviewees also expressed an interest in learning Galician and Welsh. Although the language teachers in the Welsh context believed their students had to focus on either one language or another, the immigrants interviewed viewed learning both languages as complementary to their integration. In this respect, it is important to note that no participant reported speaking one language exclusively.



The very fact that immigrants choose to learn and use the local language refutes academic discourse on the exclusivity of these languages (C Williams, Evans, and O’Leary 2003). Indeed, immigrant speakers of Galician and Welsh claim the language by learning and using it. However, what we note is that they do not claim or desire the label of being Galician or Welsh. In the Galician study, none of the Cape Verdean participants claimed to feel a sense of Galician identity. Some described themselves as “a little bit of everything”, while others affirmed that while they were speakers of Galician, they still considered their identity to be Cape Verdean. In the example below, a Cape Verdean teenage student discusses how her sense of identity has been shaped by both Galician and Cape Verdean culture.

*Example 4*

A: eu véxome de aquí e de acolá porque tanto: e: me influenciou na miña forma de ser e:: a cultura caboverdiana como a cultura galega [...] non poido decir que sexa de aquí e sexa de alá.

A: I see myself as from here [Galicia] and from there [Cape Verde]. Both Cape Verdean culture and Galician culture influenced the way I am today [...] I couldn’t say I’m from either one place or the other (Cape Verdean student, As Rocas).

Likewise in the Welsh case, interviewees did not so readily accept the ethnicity of being Welsh, even if host community members would label them for example as a “Cymro go iawn” (a real Welshman). More noteworthy is the fact that they do not desire to claim this identity but are nevertheless happy to learn and use the language. While host communities may or may not deem new speakers as authentic, immigrant speakers of Galician and Welsh who participated in the study indicate they do not

wish to be bound to one language group. Rather, these languages are increasingly viewed as resources that enable individuals to shift between language communities (Lamarre 2013), creating more plural ways of belonging. In the example below, a student who is learning Welsh in Bangor describes her position as an immigrant new speaker as an “acquaintance” rather than an entitled member of the community. Nonetheless she is content with owning Welsh as a vehicle for communication rather than claiming Welsh as a language of belonging:

*Example 5*

Dwi ddim yn meddwl byddai byth [yn Gymraes] rhwng y bobl leol. Ma pawb yn glen ac mae pawb yn gyfeillgar [...] mewn ffordd dwi'n rhan o'r gymuned ond acquaintance ydw i fwy na'i ffrind nhw. Ond na mae'n champion.

I don't think I'll ever be [Welsh] to the local people. Everyone is kind and friendly [...] I'm part of the community but more as an acquaintance than a friend. I'm completely happy with this. But that's fine with me (Welsh language student, Bangor).

In this respect, the shift from a pride to a profit framework could be argued to be in accordance with discussions on the transformations from ethnic to civic identifications. Nevertheless, theorists such as Brubaker (1998, 1999) suggest that the ethnic-civic divide is misleading and problematic and points out that nationalism and citizenship have both ethnic and civic properties. Despite the Welsh and Galician governments' attempts to propagate a civic identity, the question of language as ethnicity prevails. Brubaker therefore suggests that despite ethnic concepts of nation and language, civic properties can be advanced and developed. Thus, while immigrants challenge traditional concepts of belonging such as the profit value

framework, local governments' language and cohesion policies still play an important part in the process of opening up access to and legitimatisation of the language. It is indeed through education that immigrants form contact with the 'other' and are given opportunity to renegotiate and construct new identities (Pavlenko and Blackledge 2004; Wenger 1998). Furthermore, in a climate where national citizenship tests are being tightened, calls are being made to reconceptualise national citizenship in order to accommodate both historical and immigrant groups and their languages (Kymlicka 2011). In turn, draws attention to the need for a broadening of concepts of Galician or Welsh plural identity, which accommodates immigrants who may also be new speakers of these languages.

### *Challenges in accessing the legitimate language*

Although many European minority language contexts are seeing a shift from ethnic to more civic models of identity, or indeed from pride to profit value frameworks attributed to minority languages, it is important to examine the way in which immigrant new speakers fit into these new sociolinguistic dynamics. In minority language contexts, immigrant new speakers may not have access to what is considered the "legitimate language" (Bourdieu 1977), which may afford the speaker with socioeconomic advantages. Bourdieu explains the legitimate language as the language which

is uttered by a legitimate speaker, i.e. by the appropriate person, as opposed to the impostor [...] it is uttered in a legitimate situation, i.e. on the appropriate market [...] and addressed to legitimate receivers; it is formulated in the legitimate phonological and syntactic forms [...] except when transgressing

these norms is part of the legitimate definition of the legitimate producer  
(Bourdieu, 1977, 650).

Therefore, what language or language variety is considered legitimate is dependent on the social context at hand and is fluid and subject to change. As Blommaert and Varis (2011, 4) note, legitimacy entails “dynamic processes which involve conflict, contestation and reinvention”. Furthermore, as Creese, Blackledge and Takhi (2014, 939) note, “authenticity and legitimacy are negotiated from moment to moment, and are subject to local and global contingencies”. Moreover, as Martin-Jones and Heller (1996) highlight, linked to questions about the legitimate language are questions of power relations amongst speakers. Therefore, in the case of immigrant new speakers in Galicia and Wales, although they learn the minority languages of their respective host societies, the legitimacy of their language variety may be called into question and therefore their access to the economic benefits of learning the target languages may be hampered.

In both studies, issues regarding language legitimacy emerged without being probed in the interviews. In the Galician study, participants demonstrated an interest in learning and speaking Galician. They reported speaking both Galician and Spanish with their friends in their day-to-day lives. However, when asked about their language abilities, there was a tendency towards self-criticism. In Galicia, immigrants frequently spoke about those who “falan ben” (speak well) and how they “falan mal” (speak badly). It was found that, in line with Piller (2001), the immigrant speakers positioned the native speakers as the ideal model to be followed. They awarded them legitimacy based on their biological connections to Galician and the fact that they grew up with Galician in the home. This presents a challenge for new speakers who wish to become legitimate speakers but cannot due to the language variety they speak

and their language-learning trajectory, which, in their eyes, inherently lacks legitimacy. In the example below, a Cape Verdean student in a Galician secondary school notes that it is the “original Galicians”, or “natives” who speak Galician well.

*Example 6*

E: qué significa hablar “bien” el gallego? cuando dicen “esa persona habla bien”

K: cuando hablas igual que ellos

E: sí / sí igual que ellos quiénes?

K: que los gallegos originales o sea los nativos.

I: What does it mean to speak “good” Galician? When people say “that person speaks well”

K: When you speak the same as them

I: Yes the same as who?

K: The original Galicians, the natives (Cape Verdean student, As Rocas).

Likewise, in the Welsh context, although immigrants viewed host community attitudes as favourable towards their efforts to learn Welsh and suggested a move away from positioning themselves against the ideal speaker, the data suggests that host community did not so easily accept immigrants as legitimate speakers of Welsh. In the example below, a Welsh language tutor acknowledges that native speakers of Welsh are often unmindful of making efforts communicating in Welsh with new speakers, especially immigrant new speakers from a different ethnic background.

*Example 7*

Fedri di ddysgu nhw, fedri di roi'r cyfle i ni fynd allan a chlywed y Gymraeg ond mae 'na broblem fawr yn bodoli lle tydi pobl sy'n siarad Cymraeg ddim yn barod i siarad Cymraeg efo dysgwyr ac os ydw rywun yn dod o'r tu allan i Brydain, maen nhw'n edrych yn wahanol i ddechrau.

You can give them the opportunities to go out and hear Welsh but a real problem exists in that the people who speak Welsh aren't willing to speak Welsh to learners and if you come from outside of Britain, then you will also look different (Welsh language tutor, Bangor).

In the Welsh context, although students showed the desire to use both languages in the community and confidence in using the language in and outside the classroom, participants were unsure about using the language unless they knew who spoke it. Indeed, unlike the Galician context, the challenge for new speakers in Wales is not “drowning in Welsh [...] but finding a puddle of it in which to dip their feet” (Crowe 1988, 88). This is reflected in the comments of the following student, who finds it difficult to find people in his local community of Cardiff with whom he can speak Welsh.

#### *Example 8*

Gyda phobl leol, mae'n anodd i fi ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg. Dw i'n trio defnyddio ac maen nhw'n dweud “I don't speak Welsh”.

It's difficult for me to use Welsh with the local people here In Cardiff. I try and use it and they reply “I don't speak Welsh” (Welsh language student, Cardiff).

In the Galician context, where Galician use is more widespread, the challenges for immigrant new speakers stem from issues relating to authenticity; the native speaker is continually positioned as the ideal speaker, leaving the immigrant new speaker feeling their variety is less valued and inherently inauthentic. As Soler (2012) points out, this ideology of authenticity often deters new speakers from attempting to claim ownership of a language due to feelings of inferiority. In the comment below, a Cape Verdean student in Galicia, explains how, if she were speaking Galician, she would be concerned about whether she was speaking correctly, a worry she claims not to have when speaking Spanish.

*Example 9*

Porque me siento más cómoda contestándole en castellano porque o sea [...] no tengo que pensarlo porque lo hablo continuamente pero en gallego como no lo hablo continuamente tendría que estar así pensando: si: estoy diciendo lo correcto y tal.

I feel more comfortable answering in Spanish because [...] I don't have to think about it because I speak it all the time, but in Galician, because I don't speak it regularly, I would have to start thinking about whether I'm saying things correctly or not (Cape Verdean student, As Rocas).

Despite her comments about feeling more “comfortable” when speaking Spanish, the student's spoken Spanish was not free from grammatical errors. Thus, her linguistic competence in Galician, about which she feels insecure, may not be related to her command of grammatical structures per se (Bourdieu 1991), but rather that she feels

her variety of Galician is not one that will be accepted as legitimate (Bourdieu 1977). In other words, it is not necessarily about having “the competence adequate to produce sentences that are likely to be understood” but rather the ability to produce a language variety that will be listened to and accepted as legitimate (Bourdieu 1991, 55). In these two studies, although many immigrants reported varying degrees of linguistic proficiency in Galician and Welsh, they highlighted issues relating to their perceptions that their variety was not the legitimate one, be it because it did not align with the variety spoken by the native community, or because of a perceived reluctance on the part of the local people to speak the minority language with the immigrant speakers.

Challenges in accessing the minority language through formal education were seen in both contexts. Studies in the Welsh context reveal that Welsh language provision and course content is not directed towards immigrant students with little knowledge of the English language or the UK cultural context. Similarly, in the Galician context, there is a dearth of pedagogic material for second language learners of Galician. As a result of this, the school teachers in the Galician study often resorted to adapting primary school Galician language material to teach immigrant students at secondary level. The implications of this can be both social and economic, denying these new speakers access to certain linguistic markets (Bourdieu 1991; Pujolar 2010; Caglitutuncigil, present volume).

In both contexts, our studies suggest that some immigrants perceive that not having Galician or Welsh in one’s repertoire is used to limit access to jobs. Thus, some respondents noted that, as new speakers seeking jobs in these languages, they are subject to discrimination. In the following example, a Galician school teacher discusses how having knowledge of Galician is important in some job sectors.



However, she feels that this is a “double-edged sword”, as it may place people who do not have knowledge of Galician at a disadvantage.

*Example 10*

R: si pa certos sectores de traballo é importante e contabilizan incluso bastante ter cursos de galego [...] entonces bueno eso creo que cerra un pouco á Comunidade [...] porque hai moita xente que ao mellor viría de fóra pero se priman certos curso en galego ou: certos estudos ou tal claro están en desventaxa [...] entonces é dobre fío.

In certain job markets knowing Galician is important, and they value it a lot if you’ve completed Galician language courses [...] I think that closes the community off a bit [...] because there are lots of people that maybe would have come here from abroad but priority is given to having completed certain Galician courses so they’re at a disadvantage [...] so it’s a double-edged sword (Galician school teacher, As Rocas).

Likewise, in the Welsh context, a student of Welsh criticises the lack of information provided regarding the necessity of learning both Welsh and English and claims that the lack of provision and opportunity to learn Welsh discriminates her from accessing jobs in the labour market.

*Example 11*

It’s very often used as an excuse, which makes it very hard for newcomers to accept the rules of the ‘bilinguality’ because nobody was telling us it was like this. We’re coming here for work and then we are suddenly getting

discriminated for something we were not informed about it ... that is not getting the opportunity to learn the language.

(Welsh language student, Gwynedd).

As seen in the example below, another student points to contradictions in the support provided for learning English as compared to learning the local language.

*Example 12*

Ond pan ddes i yma, nes i tsecio'r ddwy iaith achos ro'n i eisiau siarad y ddwy—Saesneg a Chymraeg ond pan es i i'r coleg ro'n nhw fel “wel mae 'na scholarships i ddysgu Saesneg am ddim”. “Be am Gymraeg?” “Mae 'na ddisgownt ond dylai ti dalu”.

When I came here, I looked into both languages because I wanted to learn both but when I went to the college they said “you have scholarships to learn English for free”. “What about Welsh?” “There’s a discount but you have to pay”.

(Welsh language student, Bangor).

Barry (2002) claims that preference for non-state and minority languages in the labour market is discriminatory i.e. preference for Welsh in employment discriminates against non-Welsh speakers. What our comparative studies suggest, however, is that immigrants feel discriminated against by not having opportunities to access education and wider participation in host communities. Thus, as Heller (2013) and Ramanathan (2013) claim, rather than becoming citizens of these host communities, immigrants experience “dis-citizenship” due to denial of full access to language learning opportunities and resources. In this respect, the desire to be included in the job market

by speaking the minority language is countered by exclusion to minority language resources and therefore certain job markets (Caglitutuncigil, present volume).

## **Conclusions**

Both research cases reflect immigrants' voices as they deal with new realities of language ideologies and practices in sub-state host communities of Spain and the United Kingdom. Our research shows that immigrants who learn and use Galician or Welsh do so for social mobility and communication. While their motivations to learn the national minority language may be also be linked to the pride value framework, as discussed by Duchêne and Heller (2011), both studies also suggest that there is an increasing move towards a profit-based framework linked to increased economic capital.

In this respect, we link the pride and profit framework to the claims regarding the transformation from ethnic to civic identifications. Nevertheless, the blurring between the ethnic-civic divide also suggests that the pride and profit framework may not be best described as a clear shift from one side of the spectrum to the other, but rather as an expansion of linguistic capital. What we have emphasised, therefore, is that immigrants are transforming the relationship between language and ethnicity and opening up new civic and plural ways of belonging. In some instances, in line with Woolard (2016), we argue that immigrant new speakers are claiming the language but not necessarily the ethnicity or identity associated with it. In this way, we have suggested that the local language allows them to shift between communities of speakers, reflecting in many ways their own plural repertoires and identities, in accordance with post-structuralist views on language in society (Wright 2015).

However, our studies also reveal that ethnolinguistic categorisations prevail and that immigrants are aware of the boundaries. In this respect, their claim on the language may also be rejected by members of the host community. In the case of Galician, some of the interviewees are self-critical of their claim to be new speakers due to the fact that they are not native. In the Welsh case, interviewees claimed that limited resources and access to the minority language excluded them from learning the language. Both cases reveal that these immigrants may not regard themselves as legitimate or authentic speakers of the language, influencing in many cases their relationship and confidence as new speakers.

With increased migration and access to minority language education, host communities in turn must respond to these transformations. While policy may go a long way in facilitating access to these languages, more local community-based initiatives could pave the way to changes in attitudes and behaviour of both immigrant new speaker and native speaker of these languages.

Despite clear distinctions between these two case studies, we have attempted to show similarities in the narratives of plurilingual immigrants who are faced with complex linguistic and social realities in their new host communities. The study has highlighted opportunities for the immigrant new speaker, but who is nevertheless faced with challenges in accessing the legitimate language and in turn becoming a legitimate speaker in their new community.

### **Acknowledgements**

Research leading to this article has benefited from ongoing discussions on the “new speaker” theme as part of the EU COST Action IS1306 network entitled “New Speakers in a Multilingual Europe: Opportunities and Challenges”.

## References

- Barry, Brian. 2002. *Culture and Equality: An Egalitarian Critique of Multiculturalism*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Blommaert, Jan, and Piia Varis. 2011. "Enough Is Enough: The Heuristics of Authenticity in Superdiversity." In *Linguistic Super-Diversity in Urban Areas: Research Approaches*, edited by Ingrid Gogolin and Joana Duarte, 143-159. Amsterdam, John Benjamins.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1977. "The Economics of Linguistic Exchanges." *Social Science Information XVI* (6): 645–668.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1982. *Ce Que Parler Veut Dire. L'économie Des Échanges Linguistiques*. Paris: Fayard.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1991. *Language and Symbolic Power*, edited by John B Thompson. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Brooks, Simon. 2009. "The Rhetoric of Civic 'Inclusivity' and the Welsh Language." *Contemporary Wales, University of Wales Press* 22 (1): 1–15.
- Brubaker, R. 1998. "Myths and Misconceptions in the Study of Nationalism." In *The State of the Nation: Ernest Gellner and the Theory of Nationalism*, edited by J A Hall, 272–306. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brubaker, Rogers. 1999. "The Manichean Myth: Rethinking the Distinction between 'Civic' and 'Ethnic' Nationalism." In *Nation and National Identity: The European Experience in Perspective*, edited by Hanspeter Kriesi, 55–71. Zürich: Rüegger.
- Creese, Angela, Adrian Blackledge, and Jaspreet Kaur Takhi. 2014. "The Ideal 'Native Speaker' Teacher: Negotiating Authenticity and Legitimacy in the

- Language Classroom.” *Modern Language Journal* 98 (4): 937–51.  
doi:10.1111/modl.12148.
- Crowe, A. 1988. *Yr Wlpan Yn Israel*. Aberystwyth: Canolfan Ymchwil Cymraeg i Oedolion.
- del Valle, José. 2000. “Monoglossic Policies for a Heteroglossic Culture: Misinterpreted Multilingualism in Modern Galicia.” *Language & Communication* 20: 105–32.
- Duchêne, A, and Monica Heller, eds. 2012. *Language in Late Capitalism. Pride and Profit*. London: Routledge.
- Frias-Conde, Xavier. 2006. “A Normalización Lingüística na Romania : A Normalización da Lingua e Normalización dos Falantes (o Caso dos Neofalantes).” *Ianua. Revista Philologica Romanica* 6: 49–68.
- Gruffudd, Heini, and Steve Morris. 2012. *Canolfannau Cymraeg and Social Networks of Adult Learners of Welsh: Efforts to Reverse Language Shift in Comparatively Non-Welsh-Speaking Communities*. Swansea: Swansea University.
- Heller, Monica. 2007. “Bilingualism as Ideology and Practice.” In *Bilingualism: A Social Approach*, edited by Monica Heller, 1–22. Hampshire, New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Heller, Monica. 2011. *Paths to Post-Nationalism: A Critical Ethnography of Language and Identity*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.
- Heller, Monica. 2013. “Language and Dis-Citizenship in Canada.” *Journal of Language, Identity & Education* 12 (3): 189–92.  
doi:10.1080/15348458.2013.797272.
- Higham, Gwennan. 2014. “Teaching Welsh to ESOL Students: Issues of Intercultural Citizenship.” In *Language Issues in Migration and Integration: Perspectives*

- from Teachers and Learners*, edited by David Mallows, 111-122. London: British Council.
- Hoffmann, Charlotte. 2000. "Balancing Language Planning and Language Rights: Catalonia's Uneasy Juggling Act." *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development* 21 (5): 425-41.
- Iglesias Álvarez, Ana, and Fernando Ramallo. 2002. "Language as a Diacritical in Terms of Cultural and Resistance Identities in Galicia." *Estudios de Sociolingüística* 3 (2): 255-87. doi:10.1558/sols.v3i2.255.
- Instituto Galego de Estatística. 2013. "Enquisa de Condicións de Vida Das Familias. Coñecemento E Uso Do Galego. Ano 2013." Santiago: Xunta de Galicia. [http://www.ige.eu/estatico/estat.jsp?ruta=html/gl/ecv/ECV\\_ResumoResultados\\_galego.html](http://www.ige.eu/estatico/estat.jsp?ruta=html/gl/ecv/ECV_ResumoResultados_galego.html)
- Kymlicka, Will. 2011. "Multicultural Citizenship within Multination States." *Ethnicities* 11 (3): 281-302. doi:10.1177/1468796811407813.
- Lamarre, Patricia. 2013. "Catching 'Montréal on the Move' and Challenging the Discourse of Unilingualism in Québec." *Anthropologica* 55 (1): 41-56.
- Lamarre, Patricia, and D. Dagenais. 2004. "Linguistic Representations of Trilingual Youth in Two Canadian Cities." In *Trilingualism in Family, School, and Community*, edited by Charlotte Hoffmann and Jehannes Ytsma, 53-74. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Lorenzo Suárez, Anxo M. 2008. "A Situación Sociolingüística do Galego: Unha Lectura." *Grial: Revista Galega de Cultura* 179. Galaxia, Vigo: 19-31. <https://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=2748052>
- Mac Giolla Chríost, Diarmuid, Patrick Carlin, Sioned Davies, Tess Fitzpatrick, Anys Pys Jones, Rachel Heath-Davies, Jennifer Marshall et al. 2012. *Welsh for Adults*

*Teaching and Learning Approaches, Methodologies and Resources: A Comprehensive Research Study and Critical Review of the Way Forward.*

Cardiff: Welsh Government.

<https://orca.cf.ac.uk/39114/1/FINAL%20WHOLE%20Drafft%20Ymgynghorol.pdf>

Martin-Jones, Marilyn, and Monica Heller. 1996. "Introduction to the Special Issues on Education in Multilingual Settings: Discourse, Identities, and Power. Part I: Constructing Legitimacy." *Linguistics and Education* 8: 3–16.

Mill, John Stuart. 1861 (2007). *Utilitarianism, Liberty & Representative Government*. Rockville: Wildside Press.

Monteagudo, Henrique. 2004. "Do Uso Á Norma, Da Norma Ao Uso (Variación Sociolingüística E Estandarización No Idioma Galego)." In *Norma Lingüística E Variación*, edited by Rosario Álvarez and Henrique Monteagudo, 377–436. Santiago de Compostela: Consello da Cultura Galega/Instituto da Lingua Galega.

Muro, D., and A. Quiroga. 2005. "Spanish Nationalism: Ethnic or Civic?" *Ethnicities* 5 (1): 9–29. doi:10.1177/1468796805049922.

O'Rourke, Bernadette. 2011. "Whose Language Is It? Struggles for Language Ownership in an Irish Language Classroom." *Journal of Language, Identity & Education* 10 (5): 327–45. doi:10.1080/15348458.2011.614545.

O'Rourke, Bernadette, Joan Pujolar, and Fernando Ramallo. 2015. "New Speakers of Minority Languages: The Challenging Opportunity." *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 231: 1–20. doi:10.1515/ijsl-2014-0029.

O'Rourke, Bernadette, and Fernando Ramallo. 2010. "Los Nuevos Hablantes de Lenguas Minoritarias: Una Comparación Entre Galicia Y Irlanda." In *Proceedings of the IX Congreso Internacional de Lingüística General*, 1684–



1700. Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid.
- O'Rourke, Bernadette, and Fernando Ramallo. 2013. "Competing Ideologies of Linguistic Authority amongst New Speakers in Contemporary Galicia." *Language in Society* 42 (3): 287–305.
- Pavlenko, A, and A Blackledge. 2004. *Negotiation of Identities in Multilingual Contexts*. Bilingual Education and Bilingualism. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Peirce, Bonny Norton. 1995. "Social Identity, Investment, and Language Learning." *TESOL Quarterly* 29 (1): 9. doi:10.2307/3587803.
- Piller, Ingrid. 2001. "Who, If Anyone, Is a Native Speaker?" *Anglistik. Mitteilungen des Verbandes Deutscher Anglisten* 12 (2): 109–21.
- Pujolar, Joan. 2010. "Immigration and Language Education in Catalonia: Between National and Social Agendas." *Linguistics and Education* 21 (3). Elsevier Inc.: 229–43. doi:10.1016/j.linged.2009.10.004.
- Ramanathan, V. ed. 2013. *Language Policies and (Dis)Citizenship: Rights, Access, Pedagogies*. North York, Ontario: Multilingual Matters.
- Robert, Elen. 2009. "Accommodating New Speakers? An Attitudinal Investigation of L2 Speakers of Welsh in South-East Wales." *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 195: 93–116.
- Silva Domínguez, Carme, and Montserrat Recalde. 2012. "A Política Educativa Galega para as Novas Minorías Etnolingüísticas." Paper presented at X Congreso da Asociación Internacional de Estudos Galegos, Cardiff, September 12-14.
- Soler, Josep. 2012. "The Anonymity of Catalan and the Authenticity of Estonian: Two Paths for the Development of Medium-Sized Languages." *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* 16 (2): 153-163. doi:10.1080/13670050.2012.720665.

- Thomas, Huw S., and Colin H. Williams. 2013. *Parents, Personalities and Power: Welsh-Medium Schools in South-East Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press.
- Welsh Government. 2012. *Understanding Wales*. Cardiff: Welsh Government.
- Wenger, E. 1998. *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity (Learning in Doing: Social, Cognitive and Computational Perspectives)*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Williams, Charlotte, Neil Evans, and Paul O’Leary. 2003. *A Tolerant Nation? Exploring Ethnic Diversity in Wales*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press.
- Williams, Charlotte. 2004. “Can We Live Together? Wales and the Multicultural Question.” *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion* 11: 216–30.
- Williams, Daniel G. 2015. *Wales Unchained: Literature, Politics and Identity in the American Century*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press.
- Woolard, Kathryn. 2016. *Singular and Plural: Ideologies of Linguistic Authority in 21st Century Catalonia*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Wright, Sue. 2015. “What Is Language? A Response to Philippe van Parijs.” *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 18 (2): 113–30.
- Xunta de Galicia. 2004. *Plan xeral de normalización da lingua galega*. Santiago de Compostela: Xunta de Galicia.
- [http://www.lingua.gal/c/document\\_library/get\\_file?folderId=1647062&name=D\\_LFE-8928.pdf](http://www.lingua.gal/c/document_library/get_file?folderId=1647062&name=D_LFE-8928.pdf)